

Monday, May 6, 2019
Pasadena City College
Circadian
1570 E. Colorado Boulevard, Pasadena, CA 91106

President	Lynora Rogacs
Vice President	Shelagh Rose
Secretary	Matt Henes
Treasurer	Veronica Jaramillo
Parliamentarian	Vanessa Schulz
Adjunct Faculty	Beville Constantine (PCA)
Adjunct Faculty	Erika Ruvell (VAMS)
Adjunct Faculty	Richard Allen (CEC)
Adjunct Faculty	Dwane Christensen (Math)
Adjunct Faculty	Gayane Gerome (Counseling)
Business, Engineering, Technology	Earlie Douglas
Counseling	Myriam Altounji Sara Miranda
DSPS	Rosemary Scott
English	Emily Fernandez Tim Melnarik
Kinesiology	Terry Stoddard
Languages	Loknath Persaud
Library	Ken Simon
Mathematics	Lyman Chaffee Xiaodan Leng Linda Hintzman
Natural Sciences	Susan Bower
Social Sciences	Jennifer Fiebig Thea Alvarado Jennifer Preston (Alt)
Visual, Media & Performing Arts	Dave Cuatt Kris Pilon (Alt)
Absent	
Business, Engineering & Technology	Saeed Abedzadeh (Engineering)
CEC: Noncredit	Rhonda Williams

Health Sciences	Blanca Rodriguez Paula Vento
Languages	Melissa Michelson
Natural Sciences	Bryan Wilbur
Performing and Communication Arts	Maria Fortuna Dean Eric Larson
Social Sciences	Kaitzer Puglia Bakhtawar Bhadha
Visual, Media & Performing Arts	Rod Foster

Guests

Executive Director, Institutional Effectiveness & Planning	Crystal Kollross
Research Analyst, IEP	Dan Huynh
Director, Professional Development	Dr. Jason Robinson
Classified Senate	Audrey Joseph
Director, Student Equity	Michaela Mares-Tamayo
PCCFA:	Mark Whitworth

- A. CALL TO ORDER by President L. Rogacs at 3:05 pm.
- B. PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE led by J. Fiebig.

REQUEST FOR MOTION by President Rogacs

MOTION made and seconded by K. Pilon and T. Alvarado for the Senate to add to Consent Item C the following appointments to the original list sent with the Agenda Handouts:

1) to Strategic Planning Committee Workgroups: Carmen Stephens (DSPS Counseling); Sarah Barker (PCA); Armia Walker (Counseling), Danielle Rapue Library; and 2) to the Reassigned Time Committee: Shelagh Rose (Languages/ESL) and Veronica Jaramillo (Natural Sciences).

- Concern expressed by K. Pilon that the Reassigned Time Committee web appointment feature was not working and she and another individual could not add their names. She received clarification from President Rogacs about current Reassigned Time Committee membership.

VOTE: Motion approved unanimously.

C. PUBLIC COMMENT:

K. Simon (Library): Free Lunch & Film Announcement: Film Screening of: Paywall: the Business of Scholarship on Tuesday, May 7, in Creveling Lounge. To be hosted by the PCC Library to learn about the high-profit industry of monetizing academic information and how colleges, researches, and libraries are fighting back.

D. APPROVAL OF MINUTES: April 22, 2019

MOTION to approve the April 22, 2019 Minutes with one correction (Ken Simon was present) made and seconded by L. Hintzman and R. Allen.

VOTE: MOTION passed by majority vote. Abstain: L. Persaud

E. CONSTITUENCY REPORTS

1. PCCFA Report: A general meeting is scheduled in the Circadian on May 16.

The first negotiation session will be scheduled soon. A PCCFA E-Mail will be sent out today regarding union elections for four open positions (Vice President, Treasurer and two director positions). Only FA

members can run for office and vote. Adjunct faculty may run for any FA board position. The FA's current adjunct representative is James Keller. Mr. Keller has been voted to be the Southern California adjunct representative for Community College Independence.

2. Adjunct Faculty Report: B. Constantine has been with Social Sciences Dean Archibald to discuss the current (C417) and possible options for additional space to be allocated for adjunct faculty use.

Asked for the Senate to address and clarify the following two items in the future: 1) confusion with several mixed messages regarding requirements for SLOs and 2) discussion and clarification regarding parity. PCCFA President Mark Whitworth said these are both contract issues.

3. Classified Senate: VP, A. Joseph: No Report.

4. Associated Students: No Report.

5. Administration/Management Association: No Report.

F. Committee Reports

1. 2019 Spring Rank Change Approvals: Handout Provided

MOTION approving the 2019 Spring Rank Changes made and seconded by L. Hintzman and T. Melnarik.

VOTE: MOTION passed unanimously.

2. Ethics Violation Allegation Ad hoc Hearing Committee Formation: Lynora Rogacs

Handout: pages 3, 4 and 5 of AP3050 Professional Ethics of Faculty.

Discussion

Timeline of documents and correspondence submitted by and to the accusing party, the Senate President, the Academic Senate Executive Committee and CAFPE Committee chair (Committee on Academic Freedom and Professional Ethics).

The ethics violation under discussion began under the old AP 3050 and not the revised AP3050.

APs cannot be switched in the middle of carrying out an ethics violation process.

MOTION to extend discussion by five minutes made and seconded by K. Pilon and S. Miranda.

VOTE: Motion unanimously approved.

The CAFPE chair was unable secure committee meeting with a quorum and treated committee responses as an ad hoc committee. This action was not in accordance with the Brown Act.

The CAFPE chair was worried she would never be able to get a quorum for a Brown Act-compliant meeting and has requested the Academic Senate Board establish an Ad-Hoc Hearing Committee to address the complaint.

Senate President Rogacs: The Senate has three options:

Option 1: For the Senate to request a Cure and Correct: Return this item back to CAFPE and request a Brown Act-compliant meeting with an established quorum.

Option 2: The group of CAFPE members who met could take this matter up (without being Brown Act-compliant) but still pursue the matter as described in the AP; or

Option 3: For the Senate to form an Ad Hoc Committee to look at the complaint and figure out under which category described in the AP it falls.

MOTION made by K. Pilon to discuss everything just presented. No second.

VP Rose: A motion is needed for one of three options to begin discussion.

MOTION to extend discussion five minutes made and seconded by K. Pilon and L. Chaffee.

VOTE: Motion approved unanimously.

MOTION made and seconded by K. Pilon and D. Cuatt to approve Option 1 (Cure and Correct).

Discussion:

President Rogacs: CAFPE chair received only a few committee responses after following several attempts of contacting all 15 members. Six members attended the last meeting.

The person bringing the alleged ethics violation will not be working at PCC next year.

Sending it back to CAFPE will effectively do nothing, as they cannot establish a quorum.

MOTION made and seconded by K. Pilon and M. Henes to suspend Robert's Rules to continue discussion. **VOTE:** Motion approved unanimously.

Discussion Points

Discussion of committee accountability is off topic. It was noted the Bylaws could address the issue of having committees create a list of members not attending meetings.

Opposition to the Cure and Correct option was mainly so the proposed violation could be looked at in a timely manner.

The Senate should not act on a matter which would violate the Brown Act.

AP 3050 clearly references two separate ad hoc committees.

The CAFPE Chair is recommending the Senate form an ad hoc committee (the first one referenced in the AP) because of problems with obtaining a CAFPE committee meeting with a quorum.

VOTE on approving Option 1 failed by majority vote.

Aye: T. Melnarik, E. Ruvell, L. Chaffee, D. Cuatt, K. Pilon, R. Scott, L. Persaud, K. Simon, T. Stoddard, S. Miranda. No: Majority. Abstain: E. Fernandez, E. Douglas, J. Preston.

MOTION made and seconded by V. Jaramillo and L. Hintzman to extend discussion five minutes.

VOTE: Motion approved unanimously.

MOTION made and seconded by D. Cuatt and K. Pilon to table this matter indefinitely.

VOTE: Motion fails by majority vote: Aye: D. Cuatt, K. Pilon, R. Scott, T. Melnarik, S. Miranda. No: Majority. Abstain: R. Allen, E. Ruvell, G. Jerome.

MOTION made and seconded by L. Hintzman and T. Stoddard for the Academic Senate to form an Ad Hoc Subcommittee to deal with this referenced ethics complaint.

Discussion:

- This action would be a violation of AP3050.
- The Senate is overriding and violating two parts of the administrative procedures of the college.
- Procedure is being followed because the APs cite two different ad hoc committees throughout the policy. The Senate is the only group that can form an ad hoc committee if CAFPE cannot meet with a quorum and form an ad hoc committee.
- This would not be a violation of the AP

MOTION made and seconded by K. Pilon and L. Chaffee to suspend Robert's Rules.

VOTE: Motion approved by majority vote. Aye: Majority. No: T. Alvarado, K. Simon, L. Hintzman, V. Jaramillo, D. Cuatt.

Discussion:

Support received in favor of moving forward to address this matter in a reasonable and timely manner.

MOTION TO CALL THE QUESTION ON MOTION TO FORM AN Ad Hoc Subcommittee to deal with the referenced ethics complaint made by M. Henes.

VOTE: Motion passed by majority vote. Aye: Majority. No: T. Melnarik, D. Cuatt, K. Pilon. Abstain: E. Ruvell, S. Miranda.

VOTE on MOTION to form an Academic Senate Ad Hoc Committee.

Motion carries by majority vote.

Aye: Majority. No: T. Melnarik, E. Ruvell, L. Chaffee, D. Cuatt, K. Pilon

Committee members have to be a subset of the Senate Board and not CAFPE Committee members.

MOTION made and seconded by M. Henes and T. Stoddard that interested parties should communicate their interest to the President of the Academic Senate for presentation at the next Senate meeting. The Senate Board would then select a group of 3-5 people.

Discussion:

- Interested parties should contact President Rogacs.
- The Senate will vote at its next meeting.
- The issue at hand is a timely manner and forming an Ad Hoc Committee should be done today.

MOTION to WITHDRAW the Motion made and seconded by M. Henes and T. Stoddard.

MOTION made and seconded by M. Henes and J. Fiebig to select 3-5 people from the current attendees of this Senate meeting and those interested should indicate so. The Senate can vote for approval at this meeting and can then vote to approve 3-5 for committee at this time.

Adjuncts can be on any Senate committee, including this newly formed ad hoc committee.

Friendly Amendment made by D. Cuatt recommended having at least 6 ad hoc committee members to allow for absences?

VOTE on MOTION: Motion passed by majority vote. No: T. Melnarik, D. Cuatt, K. Pilon; Abstain: None

VOTE: Aye: Majority. No: Abstain.

Senate Ad Hoc Committee Volunteers: L. Hintzman, M. Altounji, V. Jaramillo, E. Douglas, K. Simon, B. Constantine and R. Allen

VOTE approving the seven volunteers: Approved by majority. No: D. Cuatt, K. Pilon

MOTION M. Henes, T. Stoddard to approve these people as an ad hoc committee.

VOTE: Motion passed by majority vote. Aye: Majority. No: D. Cuatt, K. Pilon.

President Rogacs: Request to approve all consent items under Item G, including the ones added at the beginning of the meeting:

G. Approve consent Item C (Committee Appointments): Approve Executive Committee Recommendations for all Committees (Attachment "Item G") for all consent Item recommendations and the following recommendations approved at the beginning of the today's meeting.

MOTION made and seconded by K. Simon and L. Hintzman approving all Consent Items include the ones added at the beginning of the meeting.

VOTE: Motion passed unanimously.

H NEW BUSINESS:

President Rogacs requested to move H3 up on the agenda because the presenter has a class soon.

MOTION made and seconded by L. Chaffee and T. Kinesiology to move Item H3 up before H1.

VOTE: Motion passed unanimously.

H3: AP 4100 1st read: Sharon Bober, Chair of C & I

Presentation AP 4100 with changes.

MOTION made and seconded by M. Henes and L. Hintzman approving changes made to AP4100.

Discussion: S. Bober and M. Altounji provided information about AP 4100 and the revisions.

VOTE: Motion approved unanimously.

H1. Approve Retired Faculty Library Access: L. Rogacs

Retiree faculty request restricted only to library access, including on-line and to the subscriptions for journals.

MOTION made and seconded by L. Chaffee and L. Persaud approving H1.

Discussion:

VP Rose: Recommends involving HR to figure out who these rights are being given to. We should have a clear definition of a retiree before deciding who gets access to the library.

There could there be a possible "suite of various access" rights? Are retirees guaranteed email for life?

At what point is a retiree considered a retiree? Is it only a full-time faculty? Are adjuncts included?

How long would they have to work here?

President Rogacs: A retired faculty member was only asking for library access.

The Senate could decide whether or not this includes adjunct faculty in the recommendation to IT.

Other issues, such as email access for retirees, could have liability concerns.

There has already been a discussion confirming access for the requested library access.

VOTE: Motion approved unanimously.

H2: Student Equity Plan, 1st read: Michaela Mares-Tamayo, S. Rose and Dan Huynh.

The format to be followed is from the Chancellor's office.

PowerPoint Presentation.

The summary presentation addressed includes background on the Equity Plan; a bird's eye view of the data within the plan itself and also the Executive Summary, and then walked through some of the goals and next steps. Every California Community College must have an equity plan covering a three-year period (2019-2022); shares current data on student experiences and outlines how to address and work to close equity gaps, or where students experience disproportionate impact. Data were received in March. The assignment due date is June 30, 2019.

Numerous presentation points include some of the following:

- Data received in March.
- Some equity gaps for degree/certificate completion have been closed.
- Inquiry received about amount of spending from the equity grant.

- Female students are experience disproportionate impact across all the metrics.
- In response to why is the definition of “black” used as a reference to ethnicity, Dr. Mares-Tamayo stated this wording is consistent with the Chancellor’s office definition of using both Black and African-American.
- In regards to a focus on Equity, Dr. Mares-Tamayo said PCC is charged to invest current resources to focus on how to best serve students and purposeful investments into our college community.
- Under AB 705, lower level classes will not be offered anymore. Following changes in placement processes, it was found that removal of lower level English and Math courses support an acceleration in areas of certificate or degree completion and perhaps transfer.
- In the aggregate, there is a disproportionate impact across the five metrics for LGBT students.
- All veteran students are experiencing disproportionate impact and retention of transfer level Math and English. The data do not show substantive disproportionate impact for female veterans at PCC.
- Detailed goals were developed from metric data provided to look at Vision for Success—local goals that have already been set at the college, how students have done over the past four years, what resources existed to support students, what might be coming on line soon, and other factors such as student group size, etc.
- Next steps: continue institutional transformation and provide consistent opportunities for professional learning that are equity-minded and student-centered; bring existing and emerging resources and to engage in inquiry and design to further strengthen existing resources and services and determine where additional innovations are needed.
- Equity Funding costs rages from approximately \$1,000,000 to \$3,000,000 year. in their first year.
- There is evidence of increased student completion in their first year following removal of lower level classes.

MOTION made and seconded by L. Hintzman and M. Altounji approving Agenda Item H2.

MOTION to extend discussion five minutes made and seconded by L. Chaffee and K. Pilon.

VOTE: Motion passed unanimously.

MOTION to table K. Pilon, B. Constantine. Motion fails by majority vote.

Aye: X. Leng, K. Pilon, R. Scott, B. Constantine, T. Stoddard, V. Jaramillo. No: Majority. Abstain: S. Rose. T. Melnarik, E. Ruvell, L. Chaffee

VOTE on motion approving Agenda Item H2: Student Equity Plan

Motion passes by majority vote. Aye: Majority. No. K. Pilon. Abstain: T. Stoddard, B. Constantine, L. Chaffee, E. Ruvell, V. Jaramillo.

H4. Bylaw Article 7 (H4-H7 are part of the revisions sent with the March 2019 Packet)

MOTION made and seconded by L. Hintzman and E. Douglas to approve Agenda Item H 4.

Discussion

7.1C is a voting issue and does not include adjunct faculty.

7.1B: President Rogacs provided meaning of the wording “if needed” in last sentence of 1B.

7.1D: The referenced four-week window is voted on by the faculty.

Within 3.1 it says only regular faculty members are allowed to vote.

VOTE: Motion approved by majority vote. Abstain: M. Henes

H5. Bylaw Article 8

MOTION to approve Agenda Item H5 made and seconded by L. Hintzman and E. Douglas.

Friendly Amendment made and seconded by D. Christensen and T. Stoddard and accepted by L. Hintzman. For the first sentence to read “An amendment of the rules may be proposed by a majority vote of the Academic Senate Board or by a petition signed by 10% ~~twenty (20)~~ of the regular faculty....”

VOTE on motion approving Agenda Item H5 passed unanimously.

H6. Bylaw Article 9

Previously Article 8 was split up into 8, 9 and 10.

MOTION to approve Agenda Item H6 made and seconded by M. Altounji and L. Hintzman.

Discussion:

9.2 does not indicate how the vacation process would be approved.

The Senate can resolve how to fill vacancies other than the presidency.

9.2 needs to be “fleshed out.” L. Hintzman: “It will happen” (with a waving of hands) is not sufficient.

MOTION to table discussion all of 9 made and seconded by L. Hintzman and T. Stoddard.

VOTE: Motion passed by a majority. Abstain: M. Henes

H7. Bylaw Article 10: This is a new article.

MOTION to approve Agenda Item H7 made and seconded by L. Hintzman and M. Altounji.

Discussion:

7 is circled because of renumbering. No language change.

10.2 A is the same as 10.1 A, 1 through 10.

Can entertain a motion to eliminate 10.A.2 b/c it is already covered in 10.1 A. 10.

FRIENDLY AMENDMENT made by M. Altounji and t. Alvarado to eliminate 10.2. A 2 because it is already expressed in 10.1A, 10.

Discussion

- The immediate past president should be given opportunity to participate and give input. For: Clarification: see 10.2A 1. Only 10.2A 2 is being removed.

FRIENDLY AMENDMENT: M. Henes: To add 10. B. 5 and 6 to include what the Vice President has done for the last years, which is to serve as the chair of the Committee Support Committee and serve to make hiring committee recommendations to the president. Accepted by L. Hintzman

VOTE on Motion approving Article 10 as amended. **MOTION** Approved Unanimously

I. ACADEMIC SENATE OFFICER’S REPORTS:

1. President’s Report:
2. Vice President’s Report.
3. Secretary’s Report.
4. Treasurer’s Report.

J. ANNOUNCEMENTS:

K. ADJOURN MEETING: L. Hintzman and approved by “all”.