Monday, October 7, 2019
Pasadena City College
Circadian
1570 E. Colorado Boulevard, Pasadena, CA 91106

President Matt Henes
Vice President Veronica Jaramillo
Secretary Gena Lopez
Treasurer Shelagh Rose
Parliamentarian John Hanley (pending approval)

Adjunct Faculty Beville Constantine (PCA)
Adjunct Faculty Dwane Christensen (Math)
Adjunct Faculty Gita Endore (CEC: Non Credit)
Adjunct Faculty Gayane Gerome (Counseling)

BET: Business Richard Allen
BET: Engineering Saeed Abedzadeh
BET: Business Mariam Katrjyan

Counseling James Aragon
Myriam Altounji [Alt]

DSPS Rosemary Scott

English Bryan Gonzalez
Tim Melnarik
Vanitha Swaminathan

Health Sciences Blanca Rodriguez
Paula Vento

Languages/ESL Lindsey Ruiz
Xiu-Zhi Zoe Wu [Alt]

Library Ken Simon

Mathematics Lyman Chaffee
Xiaodan Leng
Juan Leon
Linda Hintzman
Grayr Andreasyan [Alt]
Rebecca Courter [Alt]
Jorge Encinas [Alt]
Joshua Hidalgo [Alt]

Natural Sciences Susan Bower
Bryan Wilbur
Michael Vendrasco
A. CALL TO ORDER: 3:00 PM
B. PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE Led by J. Fiebig
C. PUBLIC COMMENT: None

MOTION made by V. Jaramillo to make an “Emergency Addition” to the agenda (Item H.3.d) to approve Thea Alvarado as Faculty Accreditation Coordinator.

VOTE: Approved Unanimously

D. APPROVAL OF MINUTES: Sept. 23, 2019
MOTION made by K. Simon approving Agenda Item D. Approved: No objections.

E. CONSTITUENCY REPORTS
1. PCCFA Report: Mark Whitworth: Negotiations were held last week with language discussions continuing. They will “return to the table” 101519. There is a General Meeting in Creveling on 101019, at 12PM. Lunch will be provided. On 101119 in Creveling from 12PM-2PM is a part-time, meet and greet meeting. Food will be provided.
2. Adjunct Faculty Report: B. Constantine: The new Adjunct Faculty Lab in C109 is open. A working printer will soon be added. They are working with the union regarding their health insurance position.
4. Associated Students: No report.
5. Administration/Management Association: No report.

President Henes requested the Senate to be judicious about how extensions for time are used. A “Motion To Extend Time” requires 2/3 majority (not just a simple majority.) The bulk of the Officers’ Reports will be at the end of today’s meeting.

F. ACADEMIC SENATE OFFICER’S REPORT
1. Treasurer’s Report: The Senate’s PSFCU account balances presented are:
   Checking: $4,341 and Savings $14,583. Senate Treasurer S. Rose: There was a Senate employee contribution and expense amounts for coffee for senate meetings and office supplies.

G. STANDING INFORMATION ITEMS
1. Guided Pathways, Myriam Altounji: M. Altounji said the Guided Pathways working group met today. Their focus is on guided entry and are looking at recommendations for PCC’s guided entry process. Recommendations will be forwarded to other groups.
2. Accreditation, Matt Henes
   Writing of the ISER (Institutional Self-Study Evaluation Report) is underway with a target deadline date of December 31, 2019. It will go through shared governance review and gathering of feedback in spring 2020. Writing Teams participants include: Alex Boekelheide: Collegiality and Communications; Brock Klein: Addressing the Needs of Part-time Students writing team; Christopher Theung is a student member on the Standard 2 Writing Team and Trustee Berlinda Brown is on the Standard 4 Shared Governance writing team.

H. APPROVE CONSENT ITEM C (Committee Appointments): Executive Committee Recommendations for all Positions:
   1. Hiring Committee
      a. Veronica Jaramillo to Center Coordinator, Student Equity hiring committee
      b. Barry Chess, Katarina Rodriguez, and Veronica Jaramillo to Dean, Natural Sciences hiring committee
      c. Michelle Banks (English) and Robert Oventile (English) to English Coordinator hiring committee
   2. Academic Senate Subcommittees
      a. Miki Sumitomo (Languages and ESL) to Faculty Committee on Online Education
      b. Sarah Barker (PCA) and Natalie Galindo (PCA) (alt) to Faculty Hiring Priorities Committee
      c. Rebecca Courter (Math and CS) to Career and Technical Education Committee
      d. Salvador Diaz (BET) to Learning Assessment Committee
   3. Campus-Wide Committees
      a. Joshua Hidalgo (Math and CS) to Open Educational Resources Committee
      b. Mikage Kuroki (English) to Flex Advisory Committee
      c. Akilah Brown (English) to Distance Education Standing Committee
      d. Thea Alvarado as Faculty Accreditation Coordinator.
      e. MOTION made by L. Chaffee approving Consent Item C.
         This includes the addition of Agenda Item H.3.d. to approve Thea Alvarado as Faculty Accreditation Coordinator. (She will become faculty co-chair of the Accreditation Standing Committee.)
         VOTE: Motion carries unanimously.
I  PRESIDENT’S RECOMMENDATION

1. Appoint John Hanley (Natural Sciences) as parliamentarian.
   According to the Bylaws, it is the duty of the Academic Senate President to recommend a parliamentarian who is operational following Senate approval.
   **MOTION 1** made by G. Endore approving J. Hanley as parliamentarian.

**MOTION TO TABLE DISCUSSION** by J. Aragon.

**VOTE**: Motion fails  Aye: 5 (L. Chaffee, B. Constantine, J. Aragon, J. Leon, D. Cuatt) No:21

**MOTION** by D. Cuatt for a one-minute extension on discussion. **VOTE**: Unanimously approved.

**ROLL CALL VOTE on MOTION 1**: Motion passed.  Aye: 23  Nay: 2 (B. Constantine; J. Aragon)

J  UNFINISHED BUSINESS

1. Academic Senate Norms, Shelagh Rose.
   An amendment to add Norm #10 was approved at the September 23 Senate meeting.
   **MOTION** made by D. Christensen approving the Academic Senate Norms 2019-20.
   Discussion:
   S. Rose received and acted upon a suggestion from the floor for the following:

   **AMENDMENT** by S. Rose to actively collaborate with our Associated Students in achieving mutual goals. **VOTE**: Amendment approved unanimously.

   **VOTE on MOTION** to adopt norms with amendment: Motion passed.
   **AYE**: Majority  **Abstain**: T. Melnarik

   **MOTION** by M. Altounji to take agenda items out of order and to have Items K and L precede L5.
   **VOTE**: Unanimous Consent

L  NEW BUSINESS

1. Confidentiality in Evaluations – CAFPE Ad Hoc Committee Recommendation, S. Rose
   Last year a professional ethics accusation was made requiring the Senate Board to convene an ad hoc committee to review the allegation and make recommendation. Ad Hoc Committee representative S. Rose recounted the timeline of events.

   On May 20th the Senate approved the ad hoc committee to be convened. It was composed of two CAFPE (Council on Academic Freedom and Professional Ethics) members; one Senate executive member; and two at-large board members. The members were Ed Feser, Carol Curtis, Gayane Jerome, K. Simon, with S. Rose as chair.

   The committee convened on June 13th to review the professional ethics violation and determined there was no provable ethical violation and decided to make a recommendation/request for the Faculty Association to negotiate with administration contract language having clearer guidelines about confidentiality and evaluations.
The committee could not find specific language that would inform our process according to the ethics violation. This process was handled in a confidential “closed session”.

M. Henes: it was determined the recommendation would include that previous evaluations would be shared with the current evaluation team for continuity. All recommendations would be made by the Senate Executive Committee to the Faculty Association and it would then be out of the Senate’s hands. Clarification is needed to determine the overlap between where the Senate’s purview and FA’s purview is regarding evaluation language.

POINT OF ORDER received by V. Foster to stick with item of discussion in response to J. Aragon’s inquiry regarding responsibility for evaluations of faculty receiving stipends.
Ruling: Point of order stands.

President Henes: The Reassign Time Committee currently has no chair and chair is responsible for calling meetings.

MOTION by L. Hintzman to approve V. Jaramillo as president of the Reassign Time Committee.

VOTE: Motion passed by majority vote. Abstain: 1 (J. Aragon)

L3: Sabbatical Leave Advisory Committee Election:
This is an advisory committee to the Superintendent/President.
Interested committee applicants for an open faculty position are:

- Cheryl Banks-Smith, Dance Department/Performing & Communication Arts.
- Jorge Encinas, Math and Computer Science.

Abstain: 8 (B. Constantine, G. Jerome, M. Katrjyan, J. Aragon, B. Rodriguez, P. Vento, B. Wilbur, S. Rigon)

L4: Approve a standing rule to allow for electronic meetings of Academic Senate subcommittees.

President Henes: This process would allow a member of the Faculty Committee on Online Education Committee to attend remotely using an electronic communication system. According to Robert’s Rules of Order, if a committee is within the Senate’s bylaws, that electronic meetings can be held only if such is stated in the bylaws. The Senate could create a standing rule that would allow members of Academic Senate subcommittees to attend committee meetings remotely.

MOTION by L. Hintzman to approve a standing rule to allow for electronic meetings for Academic Senate subcommittees.

Discussion:
A rule could be phrased along with an amendment to consider the number of members that could attend remotely.
The number of absent members should be limited.

President Henes: A vote is needed to create and not approve a standing rule.

VOTE on MOTION: Motion carries. No: D. Christensen, J. Aragon, B. Constantine

MOTION by L. Hintzman that electronic meetings be allowed with the following stipulation: that a majority of the membership must be physically present.

100719 Academic Senate Board Meeting Page: 5
Discussion on Motion
Would the chair have to be physically present or would electronic presence extend to the chair?

**AMENDMENT** 1 by D. Cuatt: electronic participation in meetings should be limited to one absent member -- all members present, save one. There should be voice participation and not texting.

**CLARIFICATION** President Henes: to add the wording “participation in” as the primary amendment into the L. Hintzman’s motion.

**VOTE:** Unanimously approved

Discussion
- What good is this type of rule if a majority of the committee is physically present?
- Irrespective of the type of participation a quorum is needed for a vote.
- With membership range approximately three to fifteen, achieving a committee quorum could be problematic.
- There is current technology that allows for simultaneous communication with various participations. A requirement for two-way communication could be required.
- Each individual sub-committee would create its own norms. The Senate could create a norms’ standard.
- Electronic reliance is a “wrong direction.”
- Electronic attendance could accommodate faculty scheduling changes, child care issues, etc. Electronic communication has improved committee participation within the area of equity.
- The committee chair and not the Academic Senate administrative assistant would be required to document committee proceedings.
- Online presence would be counted in quorum.
- In response to the question “who is accountable” for committee proceedings, President Henes said the chair is accountable in regards to current committee participation.
- In the area of equity, there has been an increase with online participation.

**MOTION** by J. Aragon to extend discussion 5 minutes. **VOTE:** Approved by majority. NO: P. Vento.

- The order of online participation should be monitored and maintained.
- The chair should be physically present.
- Clarify the type of electronic participation.
- Concern with statement that a majority of the membership must be physically present.
- Committee members must notify the chair if they cannot be present.
- Statement received that accountability is required for both Faculty Development Committee Chairs and its committee members. President Henes stated four times this statement was “out of order” for the item being discussed.

**MOTION** by S. Abedzadeh to extend discussion five minutes.

**ROLL CALL VOTE:** Motion carries. YES: 29 NO: 4 (J. Aragon, P. Vento, K. Dunn, J. Fiebig) ABSTAIN: 1 (G. Lopez)

President Henes recommended this item be postponed to the next meeting pending presentation of language based on today’s discussion.
Discussion:
- Until committee work is made an obligation and tied to salary, we will always have this problem.
- Robert’s Rules does not allow electronic participation only being up to Senate sub-committees.
- Having electronic meetings will increase participation. This is a good idea.
- Could request electronic participation be handled as video conference which could be recorded and shared.

**MOTION to TABLE** by V. Foster until the Executive Committee can summarize what has been said then bring it back to the Senate.

**VOTE**: Motion carries by majority   **NO**: 1: B. Constantine

K  INFORMATION ITEM: 2019-20 Adopted Budget and Fund Allocations
Dr. Michael Bush provided a presentation/summary of the 2019-20 Adopted Budget and Fund Allocations

**MOTION** by J. Aragon to extend discussion five minutes.

**VOTE**: Motion carries by majority.  **NO**: L. Ruiz, S. Rose, S. Abedzadeh

L.  NEW BUSINESS:  L5 – L16
Dr. Bush summarized BPs: 6200, 6250, 6300, 6307, 6340, 6450, 6500, 6520, 6550, 6600, 6700, 6740

BP 6200: Budget Preparation
BP 6250: Budget Management
BP 6300: Fiscal Management
BP 6307: Debt Issuance and Management
BP 6340: Bids and Contracts
BP 6450: Wireless or Cellular Telephone Use

**MOTION** by S. Abedzadeh to suspend Robert’s Rules to limit the number of times a person could speak

**VOTE**: Motion carries/Robert’s Rules are suspended at this point.

**AYE**:13 V. Jaramillo, R. Allen, S. Abedzadeh, J. Aragon, R. Scott, T. Melnarik, L. Chaffee, X. Leng, J. Leon, L. Hintzman, B. Wilbur, D. Cuatt, S. Rigon  **OPPOSE**: 11

BP 6500: Property Management
BP 6520: Security for District Property
BP 6550: Disposal of District Property
BP 6600: Capital Construction

BP 6700: Civic Center and Other Facilities Use
Concern received with PCC, as a non-profit, cannot restrict use of school property (pool, etc.) by “supremacist” groups, for instance. If these groups are discriminating they would not be allowed to have the event on school premises.

**MOTION** made by J. Aragon to “separate out” BP 6700 and to bring back for review at the next meeting.

**VOTE**: Approved unanimously.

BP 6740 Citizens Oversight Committee.

**MOTION** made by J. Aragon to vote in favor of the eleven BPs (not including BP6700).
VOTE: Approved unanimously.

M ACADEMIC SENATE OFFICER’S REPORTS
1. President’s Report: None
2. Vice President’s Report: None
3. Secretary’s Report: None

N PROPOSED FUTURE AGENDA ITEMS: None
O ANNOUNCEMENTS: None

P ADJOURN MEETING: Motion to adjourn by J. Aragon.