

## EVALUATION REPORT

PASADENA CITY COLLEGE  
1570 East Colorado Boulevard  
Pasadena, California 91106-2003

A Report Prepared for  
The Accrediting Commission for Community and Junior Colleges  
Western Association of Schools and Colleges

This report represents the findings of the evaluation team that visited  
Pasadena City College from March 17 through March 19, 2009.

José M. Ortiz, Ed.D.  
Chair, Pasadena City College  
Visiting Team

Comprehensive Evaluation Visit Team Roster  
March 17 – 19, 2009

Dr. José M. Ortiz (Chair)  
Superintendent/President  
Allan Hancock College

Dr. Rod Frese  
Vice President Administration  
College of the Sequoias

Mr. Richard Galope  
Vice President Workforce Education  
Foothill College

Ms. Kerry Mayer  
Professor, Speech Communication  
College of the Redwoods

Dr. Kimberlee Messina  
Dean, Instruction, Science, Technology, Engineering & Math  
Santa Rosa Junior College

Dr. Paul Murphy  
Dean of Academic Affairs  
Allan Hancock College  
E-mail: pmurphy@hancockcollege.edu

Dr. Anne Newins  
Vice President Student Personnel  
Merced College

Dr. David Viar  
President  
American River College

## Summary of the Evaluation Report

INSTITUTION: Pasadena City College

DATE OF VISIT: March 17 – 19, 2009

TEAM CHAIR: José M. Ortiz  
President, Allan Hancock College

A seven-member accreditation team visited Pasadena City College in mid-March for the purpose of evaluating how well the institution is achieving its stated purposes, analyzing how well the college is meeting the Commission standards, providing recommendations for quality assurance and institutional improvement, and submitting recommendations to the Accrediting Commission for Community and Junior Colleges (ACCJC) regarding the status of the college.

In preparation for the visit, team members attended an ACCJC training workshop on February 11, 2009 and studied Commission materials prepared for visiting teams. Team members reviewed the college's self-study report, including the recommendations from the 2003 visiting team, and assessed online evidence provided by the college.

Prior to the visit, team members completed written evaluations of the self-study report and began identifying areas for further investigation, including a list of individuals team members they wished to interview. On the afternoon prior to the visit to the college, team members met to discuss their views of the written materials provided by the college.

During the visit, the team met with over 66 faculty, staff, administrators, members of the Board of Trustees, and students. The team also attended two open meetings to allow for comment from any member of the campus or local community. Because a flex day activity was scheduled at the college all day Wednesday, the team's opportunity to visit classes was limited, and members were not able to visit the Community Education Center.

Pasadena City College staff members prepared well for the team's visit, beginning with developing an organized and well-written self-study report. The team rooms at the college and hotel were spacious, comfortable, and contained information the team required to complete its work. College staff members were very accommodating to team members and available for interviews and follow-up conversations.

## **Major Findings and Recommendations of the 2009 Visiting Team**

As a result of the March 2009 visit, the team made the following commendations and recommendations:

### **Commendations**

Because commendations are typically above and beyond the ordinary, the team commends Pasadena City College for consistently functioning at a high level of overall student support in teaching and learning. All Operational areas of the college perform effectively.

The college has a long history of support of “programs, practices, and services that support and enhance student understanding and appreciation of diversity.” (IIB.3.d)

Student Services and Student Affairs provide an especially nurturing and stimulating environment that encourages “intellectual, aesthetic, and personal development for all students.” (IIB.3.b)

### **Recommendations**

#### **Recommendation 1**

The team recommends that the college develop a systematic assessment of evaluation mechanisms, i.e., program review and planning processes, to determine their effectiveness in improving student learning programs and services and administrative functions. Specifically, the college needs to implement a consistent data set for program review and process improvement. (IB.6, 1B.7)

#### **Recommendation 2**

The team recommends that the college expand its assessment of student learning outcomes to include all programs, degrees, and certificates, and, if applicable, learning and support service areas. The team further recommends that the student learning outcomes assessment be incorporated into the program review; program planning, and resource allocation processes. (IB, IIA.2.e, and IIA.2.f, IIB, IIC)

#### **Recommendation 3**

The team recommends that the college establish and implement policies and procedures that define and ensure the quality and integrity of the distance education offerings and make these policies widely available to faculty. The institution must also submit a Substantive Change Proposal to the Commission (IIA.1, IIA.1b).

#### **Recommendation 4**

The team recommends that the college develop codes of ethics for management and classified employees (IIIA.1.d).

**Recommendation 5**

The team recommends the college develop and implement formal processes for the regular evaluation of each component of its governance and decision-making structures and use the results for improvement as needed (IVA.5).

# ACCREDITATION EVALUATION REPORT FOR PASADENA CITY COLLEGE

## Introduction

Pasadena City College was founded in 1924 and established as the Pasadena Area Community College District (PACCD) in 1966. The single-college district is governed by an elected seven-member Board of Trustees and is geographically located in the western San Gabriel Valley of Los Angeles County. The college's main campus is a 53-acre site on Colorado Boulevard in Pasadena. A satellite campus, the Community Education Center, located three miles east of the college houses, the district's noncredit programs. The college also operates a Child Development Center, located two blocks to the west of the main campus.

The college enrolls over 25,000 credit and about 5,000 noncredit students. In fall 2007, the ethnic breakdown of the college's credit student body was 34 percent Hispanic, 34 percent Asian/Pacific Islander, 19 percent White, 6 percent African American, 5 percent Filipino and 0.5 percent Native American. About 70 percent of the college's credit students were under 25 years of age. Approximately 68 percent of the enrollment is drawn from outside the district's boundaries, including out-of-state and international students. The college employs 384 tenured/tenure track faculty, 44 administrators, 370 classified support employees, and 723 adjunct faculty.

The Pasadena City College Self-Study was considered by the visiting team to be generally well written, with practical and relevant references to the evidence available. The self study included all required elements, including the history and profile of Pasadena City College. The information also included a summary of program review, planning and resource allocation, student learning outcomes, and off-campus sites (including distance learning), responses to previous visiting team recommendations (2003), the Certification of the Self-Study eligibility requirements, and all accreditation standards, including descriptive summaries, self evaluation, and planning agendas. The Self-Study also included a summary section of how the six accreditation themes are embedded in the college culture.

The visiting team was met by a very welcoming campus community with everyone willing and eager to cooperate. The accommodations were first rate and PCC insured that all of our needs and requests were resolved. Dedicated spaces for the visiting team's work were designated at both the campus and the hotel. All the evidence identified in the self study was available in hard copy for team use.

## **Evaluation of Institutional Responses to Previous Team Recommendations**

The following are the five recommendations identified in the Accreditation Commission's action letter of January 17, 2003:

### **Recommendation #1:**

*The team recommends that the college expand its efforts to promote widespread understanding of its mission statement and develop planning processes that ensure that institutional planning and decision making are guided by the mission statement.*

College initiatives to promote widespread understanding of the mission statement appear to have been effective. Efforts were made on numerous levels to reinforce presence of the mission statement in college decision making. The mission statement is a formal component of the planning process as well as new employee orientation. Planning guidelines require that program planning include a review of the college mission statement to reinforce the link between planning at various levels, program specific mission statements, and the college mission. The institution has responded to this recommendation.

### **Recommendation #2:**

*The team recommends that the college link its planning and budgeting process and ensure that the results of this process are clearly communicated to all constituents.*

In 2003 the college began efforts to make the planning and budgeting process more integrated and better understood. The college drafted a planning handbook to explain how planning and budget processes are linked. The handbook explains the planning process; how to participate in program, unit, and area plans; and how to conduct program review. The first version of the handbook also contained information about how to communicate planning. Again in 2006, the college reviewed and modified the planning and resource processes. In 2007, the planning process went online where all college employees could assess progress towards goals. Forums were held to explain planning, and the dean of research and planning provided workshops to managers. Survey data show that there has been an increased understanding of planning at Pasadena City College, though the team did find that there are inconsistencies between practice and planning guidelines, as well as lack of clarity with regard to resource allocation. The team finds that the college meets this recommendation

### **Recommendation #3:**

*The team recommends that the college complete and implement a comprehensive program review for all areas and that the results are incorporated into the planning and budgeting process.*

Beginning in 2002, and over a three-year period, all areas of the college developed and conducted program reviews. The annual program planning cycle includes an opportunity to update program review. The integration of program review and budgeting is articulated in a document entitled, "The Planning Process at Pasadena City College." The college has responded to this recommendation.

**Recommendation #4:**

***The team recommends that the college's governance process empower constituents by ensuring that communication flows from and to all college entities.***

For the past six years, Pasadena City College has responded in a number of ways to address this recommendation. These efforts have included each of the campus constituencies, i.e., faculty, administrators, classified staff, and students through their various organizations working together to enhance communication. The improved communication mechanisms have been ongoing and remain in place. For example, all committee meeting minutes are posted electronically on the institutions intranet site, as well as various bulletin boards around campus. Also, representatives from the academic senate and the classified senate attend each other's regular meetings. Additionally, of particular note is the inclusion of the classified senate executive board and associated students' representatives at the Academic Senate fall retreat.

This recommendation has been met with quality responses that are complete and ongoing.

**Recommendation #5:**

***The team recommends that the college provide evidence that all campus constituents are working to restore collegiality and integrity in their relationships.***

The 2009 visiting team found that the various leaders of all Pasadena City College constituency groups have shown serious resolve over the past six years to address positively this recommendation. Establishing and maintaining a climate of collegiality and integrity among college constituencies is challenging.

The *Collegiality and Integrity College-Wide Summary Report*, the result of intense and comprehensive effort of many, has served as a guide for follow-up action on the 12 recommendations included in the report. For example, to build collegiality, a college strategic direction to identify the college's core values was adopted for the 2005-06 planning cycle. The college also hired a consultant to work with the Financial Aid and the Fiscal Services offices to bring more harmonious functioning between them in their shared responsibility of distributing funds to students. Other examples are the memorandums of understanding (MOUs) that were negotiated with each collective bargaining unit. These MOUs guaranteed no lay-offs during the state budget crises of 2003-04, 2004-05, and 2008-09 in exchange for the college being able to move employees temporarily into vacant positions. Employees have reported that these MOUs have increased their feelings of job security and belief in the integrity of the college. In addition, the no-lay-off MOUs are tangible evidence that constituents are working together collegially and with integrity. The MOUs were reaffirmed in 2008.

The visiting team came away from Pasadena City College with a clear understanding from faculty and staff that "PCC is a great place to work or study." This is evidence that this recommendation has been met with a thorough response.

## **Eligibility Requirements**

### **1. Authority**

The team confirmed that the Accrediting Commission for Community and Junior Colleges, Western Association of Schools and Colleges Letter of Reaffirmation of Accreditation is on file in the president's office and that a notation of this status is printed in the college catalog.

### **2. Mission**

The team confirmed that the college's mission statement was adopted in 2002 and is published on page I of the 2008-09 college catalog and on the college website. The mission statement defines the college's commitment to student learning in its first line, "The mission of Pasadena City College is successful student learning."

### **3. Governing Board**

The team confirmed that the college is governed by a seven-member board of trustees, under the authority of California State Education Code section 70902. Its members are popularly elected from within the seven areas of the district as described in bylaw 1020. Bylaw 1010 forbids a Board member from being an employee of the college. The board has a conflict of interest bylaw, 1480, and a code of ethics bylaw, 1450.

### **4. Chief Executive Officer**

The Board of Trustees hires the president as a full-time employee of the college. Bylaw 1100 establishes that the president serves as the secretary to the Board. The Board delegates the requisite authority to the president to administer Board policies as described in bylaw 1620.

### **5. Administrative Capacity**

The administrative capacity of the college is documented in the organizational charts contained in its self study. The persons filling administrative positions are full time. The preparation and experience to provide administrative services are assessed as part of the hiring process.

### **6. Operational Status**

The operational status of the college is documented by the college fact book, *Observations*, which contains enrollment history, counts of students who have transferred to four-year universities, and counts of degrees and certificates awarded. This information can be verified through records available at the California Community Colleges Chancellor's Office.

## **7. Degrees**

The college catalog lists the degrees that are available at the college and identifies the courses for which degree credit is granted. The number of degrees and certificates awarded is documented in the college fact book, *Observations*. Data available through the California Community Colleges Chancellor's Office Data Mart document that Pasadena City College is one of the top performers among single campus colleges in terms of the number of degrees issued.

## **8. Educational Programs**

The college's degree programs and requirements are listed and described in the college catalog. The Course Outlines of Record have been reviewed by the California Community Colleges Chancellor's Office and judged to be of sufficient content, length, quality, and rigor to be appropriate for a community college. The institutional learning outcomes that are the culmination of a degree are listed on pages 2-4 of the 2008-09 college catalog.

## **9. Academic Credit**

The college awards academic credit based upon generally accepted practices among degree granting institutions. The standards by which unit credit is awarded for classroom work is described on pages 491-495 of the 2008-09 college catalog. The college's process for accepting transfer credit from other institutions is described on pages 500-501 of the college catalog.

## **10. Student Learning Achievement**

Programs have identified the expected student learning and achievement outcomes in the annual program plans. The plans are available online to all college employees. Program outcomes are printed in the 2008-09 college catalog, pages 9-29. Some of the outcomes for career and technical programs (e.g., administration of justice, automotive technology, culinary arts, etc.) are printed in the "occupational curricula" section of the catalog. The college is in the process of developing a systematic assessment of student achievement of the learning outcomes. Some areas are further ahead than others.

## **11. General Education**

The college's general education breadth and competency (reading, written communication, mathematics, and diversity) requirements are listed in the "AA/AS Requirements" section of the catalog. The college's philosophy of general education is also in this section. The institutional learning outcomes for students who complete degrees are listed on pages 2-4 of the catalog.

## **12. Academic Freedom**

Board policy 3100, Academic Freedom, guarantees an atmosphere of free inquiry and expression for faculty, students, classified, administrators, and trustees.

### **13. Faculty**

A table in standard IIIA.2 of this self study documents the college's 384 contract faculty and 723 adjunct faculty. The table also shows that the number of faculty the college has is appropriate for the size of its student body. Board policy 3200 specifies that the expertise for curriculum development and innovation resides with the faculty. The faculty and the degrees each hold are listed in the college catalog.

### **14. Student Services**

The college offers a full range of student services, which are described in the college catalog. As part of the college application (questions 16, 17, and 18), prospective students can request to receive information about various services available.

### **15. Admissions**

The college catalog describes the institution's admissions policies and procedures, all of which are in compliance with state regulations. Board policy 4000 specifically addresses the requirements for admission to the college.

### **16. Information and Learning Resources**

The listings of its resources and holdings are on file in the library and are described in the self study in standard IIC. The adequacy of the library's resources and services has been externally validated by its receipt of the 2008 Association of College and Research Libraries Excellence in Academic Libraries Award. This award is given annually to only one community college library in the nation. The college also has many learning assistance resources (Learning Assistance Center, Writing Center, Math Resource Center, etc.), which are also documented in standard IIC.

### **17. Financial Resources**

The state funded college has an annual ending balance in the budget sufficient to exceed state recommendations. A \$150,000,000 bond measure (Measure P) was passed to enable the college to rebuild aging facilities and improve the infrastructure. The college has a foundation that provides students with scholarships, art for the Boone Sculpture Garden, and many other activities in support of the students and college.

### **18. Financial Accountability**

The college's financial resources are examined annually by external auditors. All funds of the college are audited, including the foundation, the bookstore, and the Associated Students. The financial statements and audit reports are available in the Office of the Vice President of Administrative Services. Copies of the audit reports are annually submitted to the Accrediting Commission for Community and Junior Colleges. The student loan default rates and relevant United States Department of Education reports are on file in the Office of Scholarships and Financial Aid.

## **19. Institutional Planning and Evaluation**

The college uses its program review process to systematically evaluate the extent to which it is accomplishing its purpose. It publicly makes available information about the college's performance, such as graduation and transfer data and success and retention rates, through the publication of the college fact book, *Observations*. The fact book and many other reports, such as the year-end reports on the accomplishment of the college's goals, are available on the college website. Details about these processes and reports are provided in this self study, standard IB. The college has created a Student Learning Outcomes Assessment Resource Center to facilitate and support the assessment of student achievement of intended learning outcomes.

## **20. Public Information**

The catalog serves as the primary document for public information about the college. The catalog is available both in print and on the college website. The college website contains a great deal more public information about the college than that contained in the catalog.

## **21. Relations with the Accrediting Commission**

The college adheres to the eligibility requirements, accreditation standards, and policies of the Commission. The college complies with all Commission requests and reporting requirements with full and honest disclosure and in a timely manner.

## **STANDARD I**

### **Institutional Mission and Effectiveness**

#### **General Observations**

Pasadena City College's response to Standard I is thorough and generally well written. The College response to Standard IA provides background information regarding its mission statement and core values. The mission statement describes the college purpose and intended population. It is noteworthy that its intended population is its "diverse communities within the college service area" in light of the fact that almost 70 percent of its students are from outside the district. The mission statement was last revised and approved by the board of trustees in 2002. A revised version of the mission statement was sent to the board in fall 2008, but the board sent the draft back to the shared governance process for modification. The modification of the mission statement is scheduled to be presented in the fall 2009.

The college has a rich history of using accountability data required by the California Community Colleges Chancellor's Office, i.e., Partnership for Excellence (PFE) and Accountability Reporting for the Community Colleges (ARCC), to assess institutional effectiveness. There is evidence that dialogue is ongoing and collegial. Pasadena City College has put in much effort to develop and refine its program review and planning processes to integrate planning across all levels. Resource allocation appears to be linked to planning, though there is not a universal understanding among campus constituencies of where and how decisions regarding resource allocation are made. The college recently moved to an online planning process that is serving the college well in tracing program review, planning, and resource allocation.

#### **Findings and Evidence**

##### **Standard IA - Mission**

Pasadena City College has a widely published mission statement that defines its purpose and intended population; the mission statement includes a stated commitment to student learning. The mission statement is consistent with the college's broad educational purposes, including transfer and vocational education, as well as student support programs (A1).

The team found evidence through filed documents and interviews with college faculty and administrators that its programs and services are aligned with its student population. The college recognizes that the population it serves is broad in scope with approximately 70 percent of its students coming from outside the service area. Through assessment of employment data and feedback from local employers, high schools, and other community representatives, the college has taken on initiatives to better understand the needs of the local community and to draw more from the district service area. The board has also become more interested in serving potential students from lower economic and academic backgrounds, and has indicated the desire to modify the mission statement to reflect this perspective. (IA.1; I.A.3)

The mission statement is approved by the board of trustees and is published. The existing mission statement was last approved by the Board of Trustees in 2002. The team found that the mission statement appears in many college publications and the college website. In addition to publication of the mission statement, the college's planning and decision making processes are evidenced to be tied to the mission statement. The mission statement is incorporated as a guide for the planning process at various levels, as identified in publications such as, "The Planning Process at Pasadena City College." Guidelines for program review that segue into annual planning require that the program review teams determine how the program/unit/area support the mission of the college. Team member reviews of annual plans confirmed that the college mission statement is integral to planning. (IA.2; IA.4)

The college governance and decision-making processes facilitate review of the mission statement, which is generally conducted at the annual planning retreat. The mission statement was recently revised and submitted to the board in fall 2008 for approval. Subsequently, the board asked that the mission statement be revised to reflect the needs of basic skills students. Although the mission statement is reviewed at the annual planning retreat, the self study accurately identifies the need to develop a systematic review timeline (IA.3).

### **Standard IB - Improving Institutional Effectiveness**

The team found that the college culture fosters an ongoing dialogue about continuous improvement of student learning and institutional processes. The annual planning cycle includes a spring strategic planning retreat to accomplish two goals: assessment of the college's efforts for the current year in accomplishing its goals, and establishing its goals for the upcoming academic year. These goals, along with the college's program review process in the fall, drive planning at the program, unit and area planning levels. Managers of all student programs and services work to ensure that college planning goals and the college mission are integrated into planning. Ongoing dialogue of student learning outcomes assessment is evident, although this process is not yet fully integrated into improvement of student learning and resource allocation (IB; IB.1).

Of the 150 programs at the college, all are required to conduct a six-year program review, with career technical education programs required to perform a program review at two-year intervals. Each program develops annual plans with goals and objectives for attainment of strategic directives, with a review of the program's prior year goals required to determine the validity and status of the goal (IB.2).

The college demonstrates the use of both quantitative and qualitative data to drive its planning and decision-making. Quantitative data used includes: Accountability Reporting for Community Colleges (ARCC), Student Learning Outcomes (SLO), Student Services Outcomes (SSO) Assessment, and Institutional Planning and Research Office (IPRO) reports. Qualitative data used includes: student surveys and their ratings published in the IPRO data book, *Observations*. Evaluations of program reviews by team members shows that, while relevant data are readily available, the quality of program reviews and assessment of data varies considerably in terms of quality and rigor. (IB.3)

The college has instituted a planning-driven resource allocation process. Planning occurs at four levels: program, unit, area and college, and uses a collaborative team approach. The college's online planning system documents the broad-based participation in the process, and is evidenced by all participants on the planning teams required to sign-off electronically on plans to verify their participation. However, the self-study report describes the college financial planning process as being adequate for resource allocation, though it acknowledges a need to for the financial planning process to be completely aligned with the Resource Advisory Committee, the representative body under Shared Governance/Consultative Committee for discretionary funding prioritization and distribution. Per the self-study, "*the Resource Advisory Committee (RAC) was intended to develop a prioritized list of projects to be considered for discretionary funding. However, during the last several years, when resources were scarce, a prioritized list was not created, and the committee has functioned as a budget information-sharing committee. During 2007, as more resources became available, the RAC re-examined its role. It has been recommended that the committee assume its original role as described in the planning process.*" Consequently, budget development and its alignment with the planning process for discretionary funding has not been inclusive of all constituent groups, and is accomplished by college executives. Evidence of broad, significant dialogue is demonstrated in the planning processes articulated in the self-study as it relates to institutional effectiveness, educational quality and overall college improvement. (IB.4)

In addition to collecting data, the college analyzes and publishes its results in *Research Findings* to communicate the college's performance on various measures to internal audiences. For example, data on transfer are included in this publication. PCC tracks the number of students who transfer and to which colleges they transfer using data from the National Student Clearinghouse. Much of the information and many of the reports that address quality and performance are available to the public on the college website, including the accreditation self study; accreditation progress and mid-term reports; the college fact book, *Observations*; the yearend report on strategic directions and annual goals; and college success rates at the course, department, division, and college levels. Publications distributed regularly to external constituents include reports on the enrollment and performance of high school students, provided to high schools in the district, and *Campus Report*, distributed to the 160,000 households in the district about the college's performance. (IB.5)

The self-study effectively describes an ongoing effort to systematically review and modify its budgeting and planning processes. In spring 2003 and again in 2006, the college Planning and Budgeting Process Development Consultative Committee (PBPDCC) evaluated the planning process, and recommended development of a handbook to correct misconceptions of the budgeting and planning processes and to explain clearly the linkage between the two. Recent efforts resulted in procedural improvements to the planning process, as well as the integration of the planning and accreditation standards through alignment of programs with corresponding SLOs and SSOs. The college planning document *The Planning Process at Pasadena City College*, provides clear guidelines for program review and planning for programs/units/areas. Program plans now require that program SLOs and SSOs be identified, though there is limited assessment of program outcomes occurring or embedded in the program review process. The college continues in the process of defining a "program", as some disciplines offer courses, but

no degree or certificate. Economics is a clear example of such a situation. The discipline offers courses, but a student cannot major, nor receive a degree. Closure on this debate is an institutional requirement before systematic assessment of program outcomes takes place.

Additionally, assessment of course level student learning outcomes is not part of program review or tied to resource allocation. The team found that the foundation for effective planning and resource allocation is in place, yet there is still lack of transparency or full understanding of how resource allocation decisions are made. Interviews with college personnel, including faculty, staff, and managers also demonstrated some inconsistency with current process and the planning guidelines. Changes to improve program review have yet to be completed. PCC has not fully developed this aspect of program review. (IB.6)

The self study notes that program review is the primary evaluation mechanism. The team finds that participation in program review is widespread and systematic, though quite varied in quality and rigor as reflected in documentation. Ample data are available from the institutional planning and research office, though there is no standard set of data by which programs are to be assessed. The format of each program review is comparable, but the level of analysis varies as does the scope of data assessed. The instructional program reviewers are provided quantitative data in the typical areas (FTES, enrollment, success rates, etc.), and are asked to consider questions about program growth, diversity, and student survey input. But the degree to which all the available data are used varies, as does the depth of analysis, among the various units. The PCC guidelines state that “there is less information available for Student and Learning Services, Administrative Services, and President’s Areas because the measures of performance in these areas are not as commonly agreed upon.” So the programs do not necessarily all use the same data. However, all programs are expected to identify program strengths, weaknesses, opportunities, and challenges, and strategic directions. (IB.7)

Student services programs reflect on quantitative data, as well as qualitative student survey data, with regard to the quality of services. Overall the team found evidence that student programs and support services review their effectiveness. To evaluate the effectiveness of the college’s efforts, students are asked to rate their satisfaction with various college services. Survey results are the basis for discussions when the Board of Trustees and Associated Students’ governing board have their annual joint meeting each spring. The five-year trend data show that students rate college services more favorably now than they did five years previously. Therefore, survey results indicate the college’s efforts to evaluate and improve the quality of support services to students have been successful. In addition, several offices in Student and Learning Services (Financial Aid, Admissions and Records, and Learning Assistance) independently survey students for feedback on the quality of service they receive. The information is used to improve services, however, the standard asks that institutions assess its *evaluation mechanisms* through review of their effectiveness, which, based on interviews and other evidence, is not evident. (IB.7)

## **Conclusion**

Pasadena City College has put forth considerable effort to respond to previous recommendations and address the criteria in Standard I. The mission statement is widely understood and guides planning and decision making. The mission statement is aligned with program and services and

is approved by the governing board. The mission statement is reviewed at the annual strategic planning retreat. The college notes in the self study that it is developing a timeline for systematic review of the mission statement.

The revised planning process has a good foundation upon which to integrate program review and resource allocation that lead to improvement of institutional effectiveness. Detailed documentation explaining the planning process and the link to budgeting is available to all college employees, though the team did find some inconsistency between the guidebook and practice, as well as a general lack of understanding regarding the decision making process.

The college planning process includes an annual retreat where participants review the status of current year goals. The retreat begins the process of developing the strategic directions and college-wide goals for the following year. This process facilitates cohesion between program/unit planning and directions from the board of trustees. While there is clear ongoing assessment of programs, and an ongoing cycle of evaluation, evidence is lacking that there is a systematic review and assessment of institutional evaluation mechanisms.

The institution fully meets Standard 1A. The institution only partially meets Standard 1B, specifically, 1B.6 and 1B.7.

## **Recommendations**

### **Recommendation 1**

The team recommends that the college develop a systematic assessment of evaluation mechanisms, i.e., program review and planning processes, to determine their effectiveness in improving student learning programs and services and administrative functions. Specifically, the college needs to implement a consistent data set for program review and process improvement. (IB.6, 1B.7)

### **Recommendation 2**

The team recommends that the college expand its assessment of student learning outcomes to include all programs, degrees, and certificates, and, if applicable, learning and support service areas. The team further recommends that the student learning outcomes assessment be incorporated into the program review, program planning, and resource allocation processes. (IB, IIA.2.e, and IIA.2.f, IIB, IIC)

## **STANDARD II**

### **Student Learning Programs and Services**

#### **Standard IIA - Instructional Programs**

##### **General Observations**

Pasadena City College offers a variety of instructional programs, career and technical education (CTE), and transfer curriculum, credit and non credit, at its main campus, the Community Education Center, the Child Development Center and various other sites. The college provides day and evening courses, short courses, traditional in classroom face to face, web-enhanced, distance education, hybrid courses, and video courses to address the needs of its diverse students. The institution awards AA and AS degrees, Career Certificates, and has a very high transfer rate to the UC and CSU systems. The college has experienced significant growth in its distance education offerings over the last four years which they attribute to a significant growth in student demand for distance education modalities. (IIA, IIA.1.b)

The college provides assessment for students in English, mathematics and English as a second language. The college has also completed a basic skills self study and action plan. The institution uses institutional research to identify student demographics and student learning needs, and publishes the results. The college implemented a program review cycle in 2002 characterized by annual program planning, in depth program review every six years for the majority of college programs, and every two years for vocational programs. Each program identifies the intended outcomes in its planning document and/or program review. (II.A.1.a)

The institution's curriculum committee reviews all new course proposals, regardless of the delivery mode, for quality and rigor. All course outlines are reviewed every six years. As of fall 2008, the college has identified student learning outcomes for 77.8 percent of the courses, with course SLOs included in the course outline of record. The college has identified learning outcomes for 96 percent of its programs and publishes these in the catalog and includes them in planning documents. Institutional learning outcomes are in place and are published in the catalog. They include five outcomes with area competencies. The institution has purchased the *eLumen* software to track student learning outcomes and assessments. Assessment of SLOs began at the course level in fall, 2008. There has been limited assessment of certificate or degree level learning outcomes. The institution has aggressively identified student learning outcomes, and is in the beginning stages of assessment. (II.A.1.b) (II.A.1.c)

##### **Findings and Evidence**

The team examined research data showing enrollment trends, transfer rates, course and certificate completion rates and degree completion for the college and is satisfied that the educational programs are meeting student needs and are consistent with the mission of the college. The team also examined the completed program review and planning documents and the program review schedule to verify that the college is making constructive efforts to assess its

program review process, to improve it, and to implement it systematically with emphasis on evaluating student learning outcomes. (II.A, II.A.1)

Recognizing the challenges posed by the significant increase in distance education offerings, the college has created, through its Academic Senate, a Distance Education Committee whose mission is to develop policies and encourage practices that contribute to the quality and growth of distance education at the college. This group has endeavored to develop a distance education website, to create appropriate faculty training workshops on distance education technology and pedagogy, and to research and propose policy addressing issues related to distance education including faculty evaluation as well as academic integrity and student authentication. Additionally, the college curriculum committee has included a required distance learning component to its curriculum documents (Form D) for all courses proposed to be offered via distance education technologies. Team members visited various distance education “classrooms” and, while ease of site navigation and breadth of information varied from instructor to instructor and from course to course (as one would expect), team members generally found appropriate course syllabi with clearly articulated student learning outcomes, active discussion threads demonstrating student participation in assigned learning activities, and structured assignment information easily accessible to students. While the Distance Education Committee has done much to address emerging issues related to distance education, it acknowledges that work remains to be done to ensure that PCC meets the principles of good practice as articulated in the ACCJC policy on distance learning. (IIA)

The college has made significant progress in identifying student learning outcomes at the course, program and institutional level. ILOs are in the catalog and courses are mapped to the ILOs. The team examined advisory committee minutes, met with career technical education (CTE) faculty and the CTE dean. There is evidence that the faculty meet regularly with the advisory committees in the career technical programs to identify key competencies and measurable outcomes for the courses and programs, and these programs undergo a rigorous program review every two years as part of the assessment process. (IIA.1.c) (IIA.2.b)

Dialogue about student learning outcomes is occurring in the Curriculum Committee, department meetings, and the Academic Senate, and the institution has provided reassigned time for SLO Coordinators, office space, administrative support as well as supplies and research support. The coordinators and the support are called SLO ARC. There is also a SLO Council that includes faculty and administrators, which meets regularly to discuss progress on SLOs. There is evidence of discussion among faculty groups on the effectiveness of the various instructional delivery modes and the relationship between student performance and pedagogy. The college has dedicated three flex days for this purpose, as well as encouraging dialogue at the program and division level. The institution makes use of its curriculum committee to establish procedures for creating, designing, and approving new courses and student learning outcomes which are included in all new and revised course outlines of record. (IIA.2.a) This committee is comprised of faculty representing the various instructional departments as well as four division deans. (IIA.1.c, IIA2.a)

The institution offers collegiate level, pre-collegiate, developmental, and not-for-credit community education courses, as well as study abroad and international student programs. Programs, prerequisites, and requirements are established through communication among faculty in the departments and at the curriculum committee meetings. The institution ensures the quality of its instructional programs and courses at the initial stage through a rigorous curriculum review process. Although each program participates in the planning and program review cycle, it is not clear what role the program review process plays in the evaluation of the quality of the program, and outcomes assessment is not generally reflected in the program review and planning documents. (IIA.2)

The institution relies on faculty and their expertise to determine competency levels as well as course expectations and student learning outcomes. Advisory committees are used to provide industry expertise for the institution's vocational programs and courses, and they meet at least once a year. The College has begun assessment projects at the course level. Program outcomes have been identified, and the institution relies upon course completion rates, transfer rates, successful external examination rates and entry level employment to assess the outcomes. However, similar to Standard 1B, the degree to which all the available data are used varies, as does the depth of analysis, among the various units. There is no evidence that this assessment effort has been incorporated into program review. Evidence of program, certificate or degree level assessment of student learning outcomes was not observed by the team. (IIA.2a, IIA.2.b)

The quality of instruction is ensured through the curriculum committee and the evaluation process of both full- and part-time faculty. The institution has a high transfer rate to the UC/CSU systems, and a high course completion rate. (IIA.2.c)

The institution provides a variety of instructional delivery modes and teaching methodologies (i.e., traditional, hybrid, online and video-conference) in response to the diverse needs and learning styles of its students. (IIA.2.d)

The institution engages in a cyclical curriculum process that reviews all courses, certificates and majors. Every program engages in annual planning, with a six-year program review cycle for most programs and a two-year cycle for vocational programs. Although data is provided by institutional research, the data elements used in program review vary greatly by program and it is not evident how the data is used for decision making in the planning process. There is no evidence of consistent, broad based participation in the program review process. The college has a voluntary review process for the program reviews, where anyone can read and sign the program review. However, it is not clear what the formal review or approval process is, or how the program review process is used for program improvement, how program discontinuance is determined, or what changes in programs have occurred as a result of program review. (IIA.2.e)

There is evidence that outcomes assessment is occurring at the course level, but these assessment projects do not appear to be incorporated into the program review process in any systematic fashion. All program review and annual planning documents contain program outcomes and a mission statement that aligns with the college's mission statement. These documents can be viewed on the web and reviewed by the college community. The program review documents

describe the programs' strengths and weaknesses but do not consistently provide data in support of these claims. They include goals and objectives; however, there is no evidence of how these documents are linked to resource allocation and do not include any outcomes assessment or plans for assessing the outcomes. (IIA.2.f)

Most of the college does not use departmental or program examinations. A few departments or programs use validated licensure or other well-established exams. Chemistry instructors have administered common examinations for several core courses. (IIA.2.g)

The institution awards credit based on the students' achievement of outcomes and objectives stated in the course outline of record, and the curriculum committee ensures that all courses meet the state guidelines and regulations (IIa.2h). The college awards degrees and certificates based on successful course completion. Although there is evidence of institutional dialogue, it will likely take some time before the achievement of stated programmatic learning outcomes are the basis for awarding degrees and certificates. (IIA.2.i)

The institution has identified student learning outcomes at the course level that are mapped to the institutional outcomes. The college is at the initial stages of assessment of student learning outcomes to improve general education and certificate/degree programs. Various course options are available to students in the fulfillment of degree requirements. The institutional learning outcomes are comprehensive addressing the areas of oral and written communication, information competency, computer literacy, scientific and quantitative reasoning, critical analysis/logical thinking as well as social responsibility and personal development. The team reviewed examples of general education course outlines and syllabi that highlight cultural diversity and social responsibility within the broad array of curricular offerings. (IIA.3.a) (IIA.3.b) (IIA.3.c)

The college catalog is used to communicate information to students and the community about program, degree and certificate requirements, transfer-of-credit policies and expected student learning outcomes. All associate degree programs have a focus of study and at least one area of inquiry in an established interdisciplinary core. Students who complete a course of study requiring an external licensure examination have high passage rates. The institution awards certificates and degrees in various occupational areas. It is not clear how students' technical skills and competencies in the vocational programs are assessed other than those who take licensure exams. (IIA.4) (IIA.5)

The college catalog clearly outlines degree, certificate and transfer requirements as well as purpose, content, and course requirements. Faculty are required to provide students a course syllabus on the first day of class that states the policies and the procedures of the class and the course learning outcomes. (IIA.6)

The college catalog describes the institution's policy on transferring credit, accepting transfer credit to fulfill degree requirements, and sets forth articulation agreements with neighboring and regional institutions. The college implemented policy 3210, since the last accreditation which outlines the process for discontinuing programs. The policy includes a communication

mechanism for students as well as a plan for accommodating students who may be disrupted by the discontinuance of the program. The institution represents itself with accuracy and consistency in catalogs, statements, and publications. (IIA.6.a) (IIA.6.b) (IIA.6.c)

Academic integrity of the teaching-learning process is assured by having a board-approved policy, 3100, governing academic freedom and responsibility, which is published in the catalog and on the web. There is a board-approved student conduct policy, 4520, that is also published in the catalog and on the web. The policy does not explicitly address academic honesty. A code of conduct for students is published in the college catalog. The institution has no conduct codes beyond those already mentioned. (IIA.7) (IIA.7.a) (IIA.7.b) (IIA.7.c)

The institution does not offer curricula in foreign locations to students other than U.S. nationals. (IIA.8)

### **Conclusion**

Although there is broad-based participation in the program review process, and the college has made significant progress on identifying student learning outcomes at the course, program, and institutional level, there is no evidence that outcomes assessment, or other program review data, are used in the planning and resource allocation process. The college does include the SLOs on the official course outline of record for all new and revised courses, as well as in course syllabi. The institution began focusing on SLO assessment in the summer of 2008 and is making excellent progress in assessment at the course level. The college is currently engaged in broad based dialogue about program outcomes assessment, as well as plans for incorporating outcomes assessment into the program review process.

The college offers high quality instructional programs at all of its locations. The institution has experienced a significant increase in its distance education offerings, including the ability to receive various certificates in Business Information Technology (BIT) completely online. The institution offers student support services and library resources online, and is engaged in dialogue regarding policies and procedures covering distance education. The college has not completed the substantive change approval process reflecting the increase in distance education offerings and has few approved policies governing distance education issues.

The college is in the developmental stage of institutional effectiveness in student learning outcomes, according to the AACJC Rubric. The evidence reviewed by the visiting team, including the *eLumen* data base, copies of program reviews, course outlines of record, senate minutes, faculty handbooks and interviews with faculty and administrators indicates that the college is moving in the direction of proficiency. The next steps would be for the institution to expand its assessment at the program and degree levels, and to integrate assessment results into the decision making, in order to reach the proficiency stage.

The college is in the developmental stage of institutional effectiveness in program review, according to the AACJC Rubric. While there is evidence that program review is being conducted

regularly, there is little evidence that the program review data is integrated into the planning processes and resource allocation.

## **Recommendations**

### **Recommendation 3**

The team recommends that the college expand its assessment of student learning outcomes to include all programs, degrees, and certificates, and, if applicable, learning and support service areas. The team further recommends that the student learning outcomes assessment be incorporated into the program review, program planning, and resource allocation processes. (IB, IIA.2.e, and IIA.2.f, IIB, IIC)

### **Recommendation 4**

The team recommends that the college establish and implement policies and procedures that define and ensure the quality and integrity of the distance education offerings and make these policies widely available to faculty. The institution must also submit a Substantive Change Proposal to the Commission (IIA.1, IIA.1b).

## **Standard II B - Student Support Services**

### **General Observations**

Student support services at Pasadena City College continue to be comprehensive and student centered. All of the services that would be expected at a community college are available to students. These include a transfer center, career center, services for students with disabilities, student health services, psychological services, veteran's services, Extended Opportunities Programs & Services, and CalWORKs. The last two programs are targeted towards low income students. Efforts are being made to provide personalized services because there is a high student to counselor ratio (1:2,000), such as academic advising for new students, and an introduction to college course. Small group counseling also is provided for new students whose needs tend to be similar in terms of course placement. Individual counseling is focused on providing students with individualized educational plans, once they have determined their majors.

Office space is now a challenge for student services programs. The increase in student enrollments has impacted offices in the Student and Learning Services building, particularly the financial aid office. Finding classroom space for counseling courses has also been difficult, but the situation should improve when the new, under construction College Center opens.

Student life at Pasadena City College is well developed, with numerous clubs, honor societies, athletic teams, and cultural events being held on an ongoing basis. The institution has increased its outreach efforts to high schools in hopes of reaching students unlikely to seek higher education.

The planning process seems to be working effectively for student services. Departments were able to point out multiple examples of where budget requests were connected to planning, and then resulted in resource allocations. Goals and activities are updated annually. Student learning outcomes are being developed and assessment is taking place in most programs.

### **Findings and Evidence**

Pasadena City College provides a variety of student support services as described in the first paragraph above. Many of these programs, such as CalWORKs, Extended Opportunities Programs & Services, Disabled Students Programs and Services, and Financial Aid, are regulated by federal and state agencies. Some of these programs are mandated to provide annual plans to their funding agency. However, no matter what their source, all student services complete a program plan utilizing the college's Online Planning System. Each of the programs could be found online. The program plans include student learning outcomes and/or service outcomes depending on the nature of the department. Also included in the plans are mission statements, resource requests, and a number of specific goals and activities. Each of the plans can be easily located in the college's "Staff Services" web pages. (Standard IIB)

Student services employees acknowledge an area that needs improvement in the Online Planning System. Specifically, it can be difficult to determine how many employees participate in the development of the plans. In some cases, only one person's name is listed as a participant.

Depending on the specific department, this may be due to limited participation, failure to know how to use the system, or simply procrastination in logging into the system and clicking on the final “review” button. Evidently documents are circulated informally and employees may not seek out the final plan on the online system. (Standard IIB)

Student Services has been active in the development and assessment of student learning or service outcomes. These are found in the program plans as well as various other documents. Numerous reports provided by the Institutional Planning and Research Office or by individual departments were provided including data related to success in Counseling 10, student health services, and computer utilization. A validation study recently was completed that revised the cut scores for the assessment test that is used for placement. This year, studies also are underway to review the scores used for English, English as a second language, and chemistry. The Assessment Office also completes disproportionate impact studies. They will be completed once a sufficient sample size has been reached. Various other research reports were reviewed, including such topics as student utilization of computers and use of psychological services. (Standard IIB.1)

The college catalogue was reviewed carefully. It included all of the items specified by the Commission, including general information, requirements, and major policies affecting students. However, in some respects the current catalogue was not altogether user friendly. This has been recognized by the college, and several changes are planned for the 2009-2010 catalogue. These will include changing the size to 8.5 inches by 11 inches, which will make it easier to handle physically. Sections will be reorganized, the index will be professionally edited, and there will be clearer references to specific board policies governing such areas as academic integrity and non-discrimination. Some of the terminology also will be changed so that it will be more easily understood by the public. (Standard IIB.2)

Beginning on page 502 of the catalogue, there is a listing of the types of probation. One of these is “Probation for Unsatisfactory Citizenship.” This is a term that could be modified when delineating standards for academic honesty or student conduct. College policies and the catalogue may be found online at the college website. Policies of most importance to students are found in the student handbook and the “Manual for Student Conduct, Due Process, and Dispute Resolution.” (Standard IIB.2)

The college employs a number of techniques to better understand student learning support needs. For example, the “National College Health Assessment” has been given, as well as several student satisfaction surveys, for specific programs such as the Transfer Center. The college provides an array of services. These include standard matriculation services such as orientation, assessment, placement, and counseling. There are specific programs for underrepresented students, such as EOPS and students with disabilities. Other programs include financial aid, student health, a transfer center, and career/job placement Services. There is a vibrant student government. (Standard IIB.3)

Pasadena City College provides access to services in several different ways. These include traditional on campus services for the services described above, such as counseling, financial aid, etc. Services may be available on either a walk-in basis or by appointment depending on the service and/or the time of year. Approximately one-half of the student body receives financial

aid, a number that is growing during the current recession. Procedures have been revised that should allow financial aid packages to be processed within three weeks. (Standard IIB.3.a)

Several services are available online, such as applying to the college (CCCApply), orientation, registration, financial aid, and e-counseling. Students also may register by telephone. Surveys have shown that 94 percent of the student body has a computer at home, and they increasingly are using online resources. Approximately 70 percent of the students apply online. The college provides interpreters in many different languages. Several programs have cooperative relationships with agencies such as CalWORKs and area schools and universities. Most students transfer to Cal State LA or UCLA. The college is able to send electronic transcripts to Cal State LA and will be participating in the CCCTran project which will allow for wider dissemination of electronic transcripts which allows for a smoother and more efficient transition for transfer students. (Standard IIB.3.a)

Student services also can be found at the Community Education Center. These include admissions and records, counseling (non-credit), a career center, and non-credit assessment. Counselors at the CEC report to the vice president of student services, but the reporting structure for other student services employees appears to be changing from reporting to the administrator of the CEC to the vice president of student services. The timelines for this transition appeared to be under discussion. (Standard IIB.3.a)

One of Pasadena City College's most outstanding qualities is its dedication to student development and life. Besides the traditional services provided to students, there are programs such as the Empowerment Program, which includes Puente, Ujima, and the Athletic Zone. There are successful athletic teams, a colorful student newspaper (the *Courier* is available both online and in hard copy), honor societies, study abroad programs, and student clubs. There are many cultural events held on campus. (Standard IIB.3.b)

Counseling services are available to all students. Although most counselors are generalists, there are faculty members dedicated to transfer, non-credit, career, EOPS, students with disabilities, and athletes. Psychological Services provides personal counseling. Counselors also work with students participating in the Empowerment Program. In order to address the high student to counselor ratio, the college has devised various strategies for the delivery of services. These include provision of two-hour group counseling sessions that include instruction in such skills utilizing online resources and understanding the catalogue, as well as handy tips such as how to park most quickly on campus. Students are encouraged to enroll in Counseling 10, a one unit course that introduces students to college. Local institutional research has found that students taking this course area more likely to succeed. An academic advising service is available for new students concentrates on providing the most important information needed for students to register for their first semester. Students attending group counseling sessions are mailed post cards reminding them to return for one on one education planning meetings. (Standard IIB.3.c)

Different strategies are used for basic skills students, including having counselors go directly to basic skills math classes to meet with students. Basic skills students also are given tours of the Student and Learning Services Building. A "Traffic Committee" meets to review counseling processes and determine if improvements are needed. These students also are encouraged to take Counseling 10. Counselors hired at the college must meet minimum standards established by the

California Community Colleges. Newly hired counselors are mentored by experienced counselors and also job shadow. They also are given homework assignments to increase their knowledge of specific areas. Counselors attend conferences and participate in other staff development activities, depending on the nature of their positions. (Standard IIB. 3.c)

The college's commitment to diversity is wide, deep and longstanding. There is participation by staff, administration and students in many programs and activities. There are three advisory groups (Hispanic, Asian, and African American) that report to the president. Several annual conferences are held for African American students and Hispanic women. There are a number of diversity related groups on campus, such as the Black Student Alliance, the United Rainbow Coalition, and MeChA. Student Health Services also addresses issues related to mental illness through public presentations. The evidence of the many activities and programs that celebrate diversity is substantive. (Standard IIB.3.d)

The college's highly diverse student body is acknowledged by one of its Institutional Learning Outcomes which states, "Demonstrate sensitivity to and respect for others and participate actively in group decision making." Students completing associate's degrees must complete three units of coursework in "Ethnic or Gender Studies" or "Global Studies." The Cross Cultural Center includes multiple components, including trips to museums and theaters, a speaker's series, workshops, and a lending library. (Standard IIB.3.d)

The college's assessment program evaluates its assessment practices on a regular basis. Accuplacer is a state approved instrument. As noted above, validation research takes place. International students must demonstrate an adequate score on the Test of English as a Foreign Language before being allowed to take credit classes. (Standard IIB.3.e)

Security of student records is maintained according to whether the information is electronic or in hard copy. External firewalls for electronic information, such as grades and student personal information (addresses, age, etc.) have been installed, and the college is in the process of additional internal firewalls. Hard copy transcripts are scanned and stored electronically, as well as hard copy applications. Students increasingly are opting to apply online. Although social security numbers must be obtained, information provided to the college community utilizes a student identification number. For example, student rosters include the student identification number. Students may limit public access to directory information. Other regulations governing student privacy are followed. (Standard IIB.3.f)

Student complaints are filed in a locked cabinet adjacent to the vice president of student services. Complaints dating back to 2000 were available for review. Hard copy records are kept in locked file cabinets in Admissions and Records out of the way of student traffic. Limited numbers of staff members have access to transcripts or other sensitive materials in order to prevent any type of identity theft or transcript forgeries, or other misconduct. (Standard IIB. 3.f)

Pasadena City College uses several mechanisms to evaluate its student services. These include an annual program plan and a program review that is completed every six years. Programs, units, and area managers evaluate the extent to which they are meeting their mission and goals. Student learning outcomes and support services outcomes are implemented, as well the other planning documents to set direction and plan future activities. There also is an annual fall

student survey. Some departments also utilize department specific surveys. Several studies were provided that demonstrate how student services works with institutional researchers. These included an analysis of an advisement program, outreach activities and Psychological Services. Other sources of evaluation and analysis include reports required for federal grants (i.e. Trio, Upward Bound) and financial aid. (II.B.4)

### **Conclusion**

Pasadena City College meets the expectations of Standard IIB. The college is encouraged to continue and expand its work in the following areas:

- 1) Outreach to underserved populations
- 2) Refinement of its planning procedures to more consistently document staff participation
- 3) Re-validation of course placement
- 4) Redesign of the college catalogue
- 5) Review of the reporting structure of student services offered at both the CEC and the main campus.

Student services should be considered at the proficiency level for both program review and student learning outcomes.

Student services should be considered above the standard for providing an “environment that encourages personal and civic responsibility, as well as intellectual, aesthetic and personal development for all students.” (IIB.3.d)

The college also should be considered above standard for “the institution designs and maintains appropriate programs, practices, and services that support and enhance student understanding and appreciation of diversity.” (IIB.3.d)

### **Recommendations**

There are no recommendations for Standard II B.

## **Standard IIC - Library and Learning Support Services**

### **General Observations**

The team found that the college provides learning support service centers throughout the campus and the Community Educational Center, including the award-winning Shatford Library, the Learning Assistance Center (LAC), the Writing Center, Natural Sciences Study/Technology labs, and the Social Sciences Learning Center. The library maintains high quality collections, services, and resources to support the diverse needs of the students, faculty, staff and the community. The library and the Learning Resource Center provide assistance with informational and instructional services. There are minimal services provided at the Community Educational Center, although interviews indicate that there have been efforts to offer a specialized data base for the student population at the center. (IIC.)

### **Findings and Evidence**

The team visited the library, met with librarians, observed several training sessions that librarians provided for faculty and their students in various disciplines, reviewed its online resources as well as their library collections and concluded that the college's library and learning support services provide high quality support to the instructional programs, both on campus, at the offsite centers, and for students enrolled in distance education programs. There is regular collaboration between the faculty in the library, and those in other disciplines, in order to determine the most appropriate equipment and materials to support the mission of the college. (IIC.1, IIC.1.a)

Librarians encourage students to develop information competency by providing them one on one instruction at the reference desk and by offering two non credit courses. (IIC.1.b)

There is evidence that students, faculty and staff have access to the learning resources they need, regardless of location or means of delivery. Students and staff have access to the library 70 hours per week, and the other learning support centers are open 50 hours per week. The LAC services are available Monday through Saturday, and the hours for all services are posted on the college website and in the course schedule. Many of the library services are also available 24 hours a day via the internet. While there is need of more resources to support the large volume of usage, the college's library and learning resources provide excellent access to students and personnel (IIC.1.c)

The college has an effective maintenance plan and has effective policies and practices in place regarding security issues. (IIC1.d)

The library subscribes to online resources and has reciprocal borrowing privileges with other institutions. While the library and the LAC regularly survey users to assess and evaluate whether the services are meeting the needs of the community, the self study does not address how the library assesses the performance of the services that are provided by these vendors or through reciprocal relationships. (IIC.1.e, IIC.2)

### **Conclusion**

The college exceeds the standard. As part of a continuous improvement process, the college should continue to explore options to increase support for its students and staff at the Community Education Center.

### **Recommendations**

There are no recommendations for Standard II C.

## **STANDARD III Resources**

### **Standard IIIA – Human Resources**

#### **General Observations**

Pasadena City College, through its employee hiring, evaluation, and ongoing staff development policies, procedures, and programs, attracts and retains qualified employees necessary to enable and support the college's commitment to student success. Employees at all levels of job classification meet and often exceed the knowledge, skills, and abilities mandated in written job descriptions. The college has approximately 113 faculty members and administrators with doctoral degrees, and faculty and staff who are pursuing doctorates or advanced education opportunities. Because the college's employees are sufficiently qualified by education, experience, and dedication to the college's standards and goals, the integrity and high quality of college programs and services is assured.

#### **Findings and Evidence**

The team reviewed the personnel files of randomly selected management, classified, faculty and on-line faculty members, and determined that the qualifications of the personnel hired appear to meet or exceed the minimum qualifications standards for offering quality programs and services. Many have degrees in excess of the minimum standard and external work experience that enhances classroom instruction. The personnel files indicate that selection committees and applicant pools are reviewed to insure a diversity of evaluators and applicants. Each committee has a non-voting member to insure that questions that would elicit inappropriate information are excluded from the hiring process. (IIIA.1, IIIA.1.a)

The team reviewed randomly selected files of management, classified, and faculty (including both onsite and on-line instructors). The review of faculty personnel files indicated that 100 percent of the sampling for faculty had evaluations that were consistent with the collective bargaining faculty contract and met the standard criteria. Each of the on-line instructors sampled had current evaluations on file. All of the management personnel files had current evaluations. Adjunct faculty evaluations are kept in the dean's offices, and the Human Resources Office did not have current copies of the evaluations. The team found, however, that classified employee evaluations were not conducted in a timely and consistent manner. One new employee, for example, did not have any probationary evaluations, deviating from the college process for new employees. Approximately half of the classified employee files reviewed by the team had current evaluations. This institutional shortcoming is cited in the self-study and included in its planning agenda. (IIIA.1.b)

The visiting team validated the self study recognition that evaluations for contract faculty do not have a Student Learning Outcome (SLO) component. As a component of the evaluation process, however, all faculty members address how student learning outcomes (SLOs) have been incorporated into coursework. Faculty members are asked to reflect on how they have assessed

the SLOs in their classes and what they can do to provide students with a successful learning experience. The assessment of SLO achievement is in an early stage at the college, and is not used as a formal part of the evaluation process for all faculty. The institution points out that evaluation is a union contract article, and faculty effectiveness in producing student learning outcomes is not specifically required at this time. However, faculty do discuss assessment of student learning outcomes in their self evaluation component of the evaluation, which meets the standard. (IIIA.1.c)

Faculty, CSEA, and Police Officers all have a Codes of Ethics. Management and the other classified bargaining units do not have written codes of ethics and will need to in order to meet this component of the standard. The Management Association and the Classified Senate, in conjunction with the Office of Human Resources, have a planning agenda to develop codes of ethics for their respective members. (IIIA.1.d)

Pasadena City College is considered a large institution in terms of its student enrollment capacity. The college employs approximately 1500 employees to serve over 30,000 students. Further, the college ranks comparatively low in employees when compared with similar size institutions. The institution is also experiencing many retirements and increasing demands on its workforce and the application of new technology, and thus, the college continues to address staffing levels at this time. The college exceeds the full-time faculty obligation number established by the California Community College Chancellor's Office (CCCCO), supported by over 700 part-time faculty members and 35 professional counselors and librarians. While there has been ongoing hiring on the campus, the self study's planning agenda to analyze future workforce needs has been validated as the Office of Human Resources' responsibility. (IIIA.2)

Staff confirmed that the college systematically develops personnel policies and procedures that are available for information and review by employees. Policies and procedures are equitably and consistently administered and are available on the college website for information. All official personnel-related documents are stored securely and confidentially by the office of Human Resources (IIIA.3.a, IIIA.3.b). The college meets the standard.

The visiting team found that personnel procedures implemented by the human resources department appear to reflect attention towards equity and diversity. The department provided reports showing evidence of the monitoring for diversity in faculty, management, and classified hiring processes and activities. These practices apply to the advertising of vacancies, the formation of hiring committees, and the selection process. Consistent efforts are made to insure diversity in the committees and the applicant pools. The college adheres to fair employment practices governed by local, state, and federal policies, as well as practices mandated by Title 5 of the California Code of Regulations. The Board of Trustees has developed various policies to ensure fairness in employment procedures, including faculty hiring (policy 6100), classified hiring (policy 6200), and management hiring (policy 6300). (IIIA.3.a, IIIA.4, IIIA.4.b)

Personnel files reviewed contained additional evidence of the college's efforts to provide training and personal growth opportunities to employees that enhance their performance in the duties to

which they are assigned. In all aspects of the records reviewed, the team found that human resources demonstrated integrity in the treatment of its employees. (IIIA.4.a) (IIIA.4.c)

In support of the college mission, Human Resources developed the *Professional and Diversity Development Program* (PDDP), a commitment to nurturing and providing learning and professional development opportunities for all college employees. In the team's review of personnel files, not only does the college make training available to all employees, but the files indicate that employees are in fact utilizing the professional development activities available to them as evidenced by the documentation of completed training in their files. The Human Resources office collaborates to develop a yearly employee development questionnaire. Data from the questionnaire is used in the planning of professional development activities and improvement of the staff development program. (IIIA.5, IIIA.5.a)

The Human Resources staffing plan is integral to the college's institutional planning process. The program review process evaluates the effective utilization of human resources within the institution units and human resources needs are prioritized at the program, unit, and area levels, and are further reviewed by the college executive committee, with decisions on filling vacancies and new positions for faculty driven by relevant data reports, i.e., enrollment data, FTES, productivity and class demand. The Human Resources office provides evidence of rigorously following these policies and procedures with regard to new positions. Nevertheless, the institution lacks any systematic evaluation of its planning processes that assess the effectiveness of human resource planning. (IIIA.6).

## **Conclusion**

The college partially meets the standard.

## **Recommendations**

### **Recommendation 4**

The team recommends that the college ensure that performance evaluations for classified employees are completed on a timely basis, and that evaluations for adjunct faculty are stored in the Human Resources Department office to ensure personnel file security of sensitive information and confidentiality. (IIIA.1.b)

### **Recommendation 5**

The team recommends that the college develop codes of ethics for management and classified employees. (IIIA.1.d)

## **Standard IIIB – Physical Resources**

### **General Observations**

The college's efforts in physical resources administration demonstrate careful planning and execution. The college's comprehensive facilities planning activities ensure that its physical resources are planned and constructed to ensure effective utilization. Upgrades and replacements of facilities have been significant, due to the capital construction programs. The passage of general obligation bond Measure P in 2002 provided the majority of funding for the recent capital construction. Projects completed to date or in progress evidence Pasadena City College's commitment to upgrading and replacing facilities that are functionally obsolete as well as maintaining the quality necessary to support the college's programs and services.

### **Findings and Evidence**

These significant changes in building expenditures have impacted physical resource planning. Enrollment growth at the college has placed strains on the ability to schedule classroom space to meet student needs. Facility planning appears to carefully orchestrate the migration of programs to other locations while appropriate new facilities are developed. Plans for all new facilities are reviewed by the California Division of State Architecture (DSA) for access and safety of students. (IIIB,IIIB.1.a,IIIB.1.b)

The Facilities Services department is responsible for the planning, building, and maintaining the physical resources of the college. Divided into four service departments, construction and planning, custodial, grounds, and maintenance, its primary goal is to provide a safe, aesthetically pleasing, and functional learning environment. The facilities department successfully integrates planning of institutional programs across the college into its facility planning. The college is to be commended for not only planning and building appropriate facilities that meet the program needs, but also for constructing esthetically pleasing structures that are integrated into a consistent look for the campus that elevates education and the worth of the students who attend Pasadena City College. (IIIB.2, IIIB.2.a)

The planning for physical resources is integrated with institutional planning at all levels. Of specific note is the total faculty involvement in the delineation of the program space for the faculty member's specific programs. This is one of the most faculty responsive planning processes in the team's experience. One concern in this area, observed by the visiting team, is that the planning process is circumvented by some faculty who use the political process to enhance their facility allocations. The problem with this violation of process is that space is reduced for other faculty that had signed off a year or two previously. As new changes are politically forced on facility planning it violates the process review by other faculty who were compliant and abided by the process. (IIIB.2.b)

### **Conclusion**

The college meets the standard.

## **Standard IIC – Technology Resources**

### **General Observations**

Pasadena City College has instituted a variety of planning processes, standards, and evaluation instruments to ensure that technology on campus supports the academic goals and mission of the institution. Computing Services and Management Information Services (CS/MIS) oversee the college's centralized systems for instructional technology, student services, and administrative services. All programs, units, and areas within the college, review and submit technology requests as part of the college annual planning process. The Office of Academic Support provides technical and pedagogical training and administers the online course management system. The Academic Senate Distance Education Committee meets regularly to address distance education issues including technology. In 2006, a Technology Master Plan was presented by the Campus Technology Committee (CTC) and approved by all shared governance constituencies and the Board of Trustees.

### **Findings and Evidence**

The team found that technology needs are identified through the unit level program review process for all programs at the college. Technology needs are summarized after a review of unit plans and sent to the technology committee. The programs define the need of computers and other technologies for use in their curriculum and their relation to teaching and learning. (IIC, IIC.1)

The growing technology needs of the college, centralizing technology support and coordinating efforts, have been a continuing concern among college personnel. Nonetheless, since the completion of the last accreditation self-study report, the college has planned and committed financial resources for implementing major technology improvements. The visiting team has been able to connect these improvements as designed to meet the needs of learning, teaching, communications, research, and general college-wide operations. Needs are identified through the annual planning process and addressed by the CTC through the shared governance process. The team reviewed the college-wide technology surveys confirming that the institutional efforts to meet technology needs are improving. However, the distributive nature of technology support causes confusion for users and has not been adequate. (IIC.1.a)

Pasadena City College recognizes the need to address the need for an enterprise resource planning (ERP) system that provides a comprehensive operational campus system for communications and to transition out of the current stand-alone systems. Strata Information Group (SIG) was hired to perform a technology assessment focused on business process analyses as well as to determine the need for an ERP system. The college is in transition to enterprise software, and is planning for the transition. The new software conversion will have a substantial training component for staff and faculty in all departments (IIC.1.b). The college's replacement cycle of existing computers in student labs is every three years. Funding for this replacement is available through instructional equipment funding, vocational grants, and ARCC funds

(previously PFE funding, and now an allocation from general fund). The process of using a set amount was developed by a shared governance process in the past and the process has continued to the current day. The system reliability appears to be adequate as documented by surveys of college staff indicating satisfaction with the technology support provided by the College technology groups. (IIC.1.c)

Input from college employees indicates above average support for technology services as provided by the technology groups. The decisions for technology use are driven by needs to support learning programs, and prioritized by management in consultation with faculty. The college's recent bond measure passage dedicated resources to modernize the institution's infrastructure. Resources for the computer replacement program (cycle) are have been set aside and appear to be adequate. Funds to support distance learning continue to increase and appear to reflect the increases in distance education demands. (IIC.1.d)

The visiting team's review of meeting minutes validates that the annual planning and budgeting processes identify the technology needs of the campus. The Technology Master Plan (TMP) identifies key areas for development. Technology is integrated into the program review process for instructional program areas and faculty recommend the level of technology use. The administrative technology is included in the strategic, long range planning of the Executive Committee. The bond measure campaign planning process also gathered input from all college constituent groups to identify infrastructure needs of the college. The Technology Committee reviews almost all technology planning and expenditures.

The team reviewed the results of the surveys of staff, faculty, students and administrators indicate that the planning does take place at the college, albeit with less than smooth implementation. Technology requests submitted in the planning process often lack detail, impeding technology support personnel from fully understanding needs and implications. Further, there is a lack of consensus regarding the appropriate balance between centralized and decentralized decision making for technology request. The college needs to review and evaluate its research and planning process for new technology investments to determine its effectiveness. (IIC.2)

### **Conclusion**

The college meets the standard.

## **Standard IID – Financial Resources**

### **General Observations**

Pasadena City College's comprehensive financial planning process supports institutional goals and other planning efforts. The sound financial position of the college is attributed to responsible financial management and prudent decision making. The college's financial plans reflect a planning process that involves constituencies throughout the college community. The college considers the academic master plan, long-range financial planning, FTES projections, enrollment capacity limits, and state funding levels in its financial planning process.

### **Findings and Evidence**

The visiting team review of the institution's documentation ascertained that college resources are in fact allocated through a program review and planning process which is bottom up. The college has four planning levels (programs, units, areas, and the college as a whole), and the process includes planning for budgeting of instructional and non-instructional programs and services. During the visit, the team witnessed the application of an online integrated planning system that links program review, assessment, and academic planning with strategic planning, facility planning, and budget planning. This online system assists departments examine the alignment of its programs or services with the institutional mission, evaluate program effectiveness, identify resource needs, and formulate future plans. Divisions and departments synthesize program plans and program reviews into unit plans. The unit plans are then incorporated into the appropriate area plan: administrative services, instruction, student and learning services, and office of the president. Funding allocations are done through a defined collaborative process that involves requests made by the various academic or administrative units, and allocations made by vice presidents, with deans and faculty involved in the decision making process. Random interviews of college staff confirmed the self study's recognition that not all employees are familiar with either the fund allocation process or the dissemination of funding decisions. (IID, IID.1.a)

Pasadena City College maintains fiscal responsibility by limiting enrollment to approximately two percent over the maximum amount the state funding cap. General fund revenue received by the college is derived from state-calculated allocation and growth revenue. An annual plus or minus adjustment to the revenue occurs based on changes to the amount of full-time equivalent student (FTES). Securing external funding is the charge of the college's Grants Office and the Pasadena City College Foundation. Both of these units substantially increased the number of grants received from private foundations, corporations, and individual giving. (IID.1.b)

The financial planning process, using program review as its premise, has continued to improve. While initially some program requests for allocation were a bit excessive, the team confirmed work of the administration to align program requests to more realistic levels. The requests are adjusted to by the unit supervisors, usually the dean. The process requires the Executive Committee to reconcile requests and available resources. The process appears to allow input

from all programs but through every level of the college the information is reviewed and input is considered. (IIID.1.b)

The visiting team did identify some spending in the past that violated the college's self-defined rubric for expenditures not exceeding revenues. However, that practice appears to have been corrected. The district budget appears to have ample reserves to mitigate potential future budget shortfalls. With eight million dollars in excess of the five percent required reserve, the district has a healthy budget reserve. Reserves for workers compensation, dental care, and long-term liability appear to be more than adequate. The college has addressed the long-range financial implications for retiree benefits in a number of ways. The PCC Board of Trustees commissioned an independent actuarial study that defined the magnitude of the college's obligation at an estimated \$22 million. A restricted set-aside has been identified in the college's self-insurance fund (Fund 61) for retiree health benefits. On October 1, 2008, the PCC board of trustees adopted a Standardized Contribution Plan that incorporates annual contributions to Fund 61 to satisfy this obligation. (IIID.1.c)

A review of the budgeting process documentation reveals that the college generally follows its budgeting guidelines, and allocations occur within the parameters defined by the planning process. Faculty and staff constituencies have input into budget allocations through their representatives in the participatory governance structure. Since the last accreditation visit, the college integrated its planning process with resource allocation and revised its planning handbook, *The Planning Process at Pasadena City College*, accordingly. The team's review of the handbook reveals specific information on the connection between planning and budgeting and stipulates that all constituencies may participate in the process. Not everyone on campus, however, is familiar with these provisions. (IIID.1.d)

The visiting team discovered several audit findings over the last two years. The findings are not identified in the audits which indicate that the concerns raised have been rectified. None of the concerns were substantive and most involved auxiliary operations. The concerns in this area have been identified, and addressed. The findings do not compromise the fiscal integrity of the district and have been addressed by fiscal administration. Appropriate financial information is provided through legacy systems and adequate controls are in place to monitor potential over expenditures. The college distributes a variety of financial information to constituent groups. Its proposed annual budget is presented during three separate public meetings of the Board of Trustees. A detailed presentation to the Board of Trustees and public occurs approximately one month prior to the adoption of the budget for the new fiscal year. A copy of the printed adopted budget is available to each department cost center manager, the leadership of each governance group, and the collective bargaining units. ((IIID.2.a)(IIID.2.b)

A review of the college financial reality reveals that the college has more than adequate reserves for cash flow and monies for stability. Funds for risk management are more than adequate and are not a cause for concern. The district demonstrates adequate oversight of expenditures and monitors funds and purchase orders for supplies, services and capital expenditures. The College has had first rate administrators in the fiscal services area, as evidenced the district's staying within revenues and having a more than adequate reserve. (IIID.2.c)(IIID.2.d)

There is a continuing concern that the procedures and operating manuals in the auxiliary areas are out of date, which was identified in the self study. The problem has been identified and plans to bring this into compliance are underway. The fiscal oversight is still in place and does not compromise the integrity of the college. The college conducts the appropriate process for bidding and proposals. The purchase order system appears to be more than adequate to insure compliance with legal requirements. The college uses a nationally recognized audit firm to review the fiscal processes of the district. The findings of the auditor are minor peccadilloes that are appropriately remedied by the district within the following year. (IID.2.e) (IID.2.f) (IID.2.g)

The college budgets are handled in a “rollover” manner rather than using a zero balance justification model because most funding resources are allocated to personnel/payroll (salaries account for approximately 87 percent of the college budget) and fixed operational costs, leaving very little (about 3 percent) for discretionary spending. How financial resources are assessed varies from one resource category to the next. At the college level, general funds are not assessed. Funds typically are not shifted from one area to another, but occasionally are reallocation when a program is decertified. Assessment of financial resources does occur for discretionary, grant, and categorical funds. For categorical funds, including state, federal, and local grants, the effective use of resources is assessed through periodic reporting to the grantor. (IID.3)

### **Conclusion**

The College meets the standard.

## **STANDARD IV Leadership and Governance**

### **General Observations**

The Pasadena City College Institutional Self Study of Standard IV, Leadership and Governance, is straightforward and addresses each of the sub-standards. Evidence of dialogue is present throughout Standard IV. Since the last accreditation, significant dialogue has occurred that has resulted in college wide involvement and utilization of the leadership of the constituent groups for continuous improvement. Further, the self study indicates the college has strong organizational structures that recognize and use the appropriate leadership, decision-making, and recommending roles of the governing board, chief executive, faculty, staff, and students for college improvement. The team found sufficient evidence that demonstrates Pasadena City College is using these governance roles to facilitate student learning and improvement of institutional effectiveness. College constituencies have worked diligently and effectively over the past six years to restore collegiality and integrity in relationships and develop and follow processes that have improved communication from and to all college entities.

### **Findings and Evidence**

The new superintendent/president has brought a renewed environment for consultation, innovation, and excellence that derive from systematic participatory processes. Faculty, managers, staff, and students are represented in the various campuswide committees. Several years ago, Pasadena City College identified core values to help set and achieve its goals. Each year a strategic planning team convenes a retreat for an open and reflective dialogue to revise, abandon, or create new strategic directions and goals for the college. In addition, an online planning process has been implemented with the components of program review, unit plans, and area plans that provide opportunity for faculty, staff, and managers to provide input into the planning process. (IVA, IVA.1)

The college has written policy (Board Policy 2000 & 2100) on participation in decision-making and written procedures and practices that outline and demonstrate how ideas are brought forward and how constituents will work together. The policies are supported by detailed implementation procedures. These policies and practices clearly place the faculty and instructional administrators in appropriate substantive roles to utilize fully their expertise in student learning, educational policy development, planning, and budget. Students and classified staff also have clear and appropriate roles. (IVA.2, IVA.2.a)

Pasadena City College relies on the Academic Senate and its appropriate structures for addressing issues of student learning, particularly on academic and professional matters. This is achieved through a working relationship with the Senate, the Curriculum and Instruction Committee, the SLO Division Council, the SLO Assessment Resource Center, and adherence to board policy. The senate attempts to communicate with all faculty members regarding opportunities for participation in the governance process. The senate selects faculty representatives for all governance committees or task forces that include faculty representation.

Faculty serve on various committees aimed at providing better educational services for students and chair or co-chair a number of these committees. By board policy faculty and administrators reach mutual agreement on academic and professional matters. The college's academic administrators meet twice a month with the Vice President of Instruction and have representation on the various college committees. (IVA.2.b)

The team found that Pasadena Community College District's Board, administration, faculty, and staff all share a high degree of pride and enthusiasm for being part of the college mission. This was witnessed throughout the visit, and especially during an all staff assembly, where faculty, administrators and staff came together to review and honor their accomplishments and to kick off a visionary planning effort for the year 2020. Pasadena City College has established policy and governance structures that, when followed, lead to working together and facilitating discussion and communication. Procedures and practices are in place that help achieve the goal of working together, discussing and communicating among constituencies. (IVA.3)

The team examined evidence provided reflecting Pasadena City College's honest and positive relations with external agencies. The college complies with the Accrediting Commission's published expectations, responded to the previous accreditation recommendations, and continues to strive for improvement in this regard. (IVA.4)

The college's reliance on the campus climate survey as evidence that it regularly evaluates its processes and structures of governance and decision-making has not provided the intended results. The campus climate survey does not provide a formal process by which components of the governance and decision-making processes evaluate themselves as entities and how the entities are working as a whole. The college did not show how it is using the limited results of the campus climate survey for improvement, and interviews conducted by team members verified the lack of evaluation and subsequent improvement efforts. (IVA.5)

The visiting team verified Pasadena City College's governing board role in establishing bylaws and policies that set the direction for the college related to student learning programs, services, and financial stability through a review of board meeting agendas and minutes. Evidence was further gathered through interviews of all governing board members, available during the visit, who were able to reiterate the expected role of the superintendent/president to assure the effective operational management of the college. (IVB, IVB.1)

The board of trustees is seven elected officials from contiguous areas and is composed of individuals whose occupations, backgrounds, and experiences reflect the public interest, including the former mayor of Pasadena. The board has a bylaw that clearly indicates board actions as board decisions, not individual decisions. Anecdotal evidence and board minutes further provide evidence the board follows its policies and bylaws and advocates for the college and has not acted under undue influence or pressure. (IVB.1.a)

A review of the board policies at Pasadena City College reflects consistency with the institutional mission adopted by the board. Through the bylaws, policies, strategic directions, and the annual planning retreat the visiting team found evidence of how the policies and board action

in fact focus on ensuring education quality, fiscal integrity, and adherence to state law—all of which reflect the board’s ultimate authority. These bylaws and policies are easily accessed through the Pasadena City College website where any citizen can determine the board’s composition, duties and responsibilities, structure, and the how it operates to fulfill its responsibilities. (IVB.1.b, IVB.1.c, IVB.1.d)

A review of the Board meeting minutes and interviews with college personnel and community members provided evidence that the board follows its policies and bylaws. It has undertaken a complete review of the policies in a six-year cycle. Plus, the college uses the services of the Community College League of California (CCLC) to assist the college stay current on changes in laws and court rulings that could lead to the evaluation and possible changes in policies and bylaws. (IVB.1.e)

The visiting team reviewed documentation and sought oral confirmation that the board’s development, new member orientation, and staggering of terms are addressed through its bylaws and practices. The board’s program for orienting new members is described in bylaw 1040. The board provides for continuity of board membership by using staggered terms of office as described in bylaw 1020. New trustees are sent to the CCLC orientation workshops. In addition, in spring 2008, following the election of a new trustee, the administration’s Executive Committee presented a series of workshops to the board about the structure and function of each operational area of the college. Further, new trustees are offered a mentor with existing trustees. Finally, the board has established and implements a process for self evaluation. That process itself is occasionally reviewed and was revised in 2007. Evaluation of board practices and policies is further evident in board actions related to its code of ethics. Amended in 2008, the code of ethics and protocols include clearly defined steps to follow for actual or perceived behavior that is inconsistent with the code. (IVB.1.f, IVB.1.g, IVB.1.h)

The Pasadena City College governing board has been well informed about the accreditation process through involvement of the Steering Committee, receipt of the Pasadena City College *Accreditation Dialogue*, monthly updates, service on self study focus groups, and action on the *2009 Institutional Self Study*. (IVB.1.i)

During the past six years, the board has granted the past and present superintendent/president of Pasadena City College the primary responsibility for leadership in planning, organizing, budgeting, personnel, and assessment that lead to quality. The responsibilities for the quality of the institution appear in the president’s annual goals and assessed in the annual evaluation by the board. The presidents have been evaluated regularly to assure accountability for these responsibilities and effective leadership. The college has documented specific examples of the leadership role of the president in addressing planning that incorporates research and analysis and is integrated with resource management; organizing the college through an appropriate administrative structure where delegation and evaluation occur; budgeting with fiscally prudent control of the budget and expenditures tied to planning; assessing effectiveness of personnel and practices; and maintaining a focus on adhering to legal and ethical practices. This leadership role provided by the Pasadena City College superintendent/president is accomplished through

collegial processes and is guided by the Pasadena City College mission. (IVB.1.j, IVB.2, IVB2.a, IVB2.b, IVB2.c, IVB2.d)

Pasadena City College's new superintendent/president has included goals to develop outreach efforts to the community, through service on community boards, efforts to create an Articulation Council, and attendance at meetings of a variety of community-based organizations. Year-end reports to the board and visiting team interviews evidence how effectively the president works and communicates with the communities served by Pasadena City College. (IVB.2.e)

### **Conclusion**

Pasadena City College is commended for the significant progress it has made to build a climate of collegiality throughout the college and to establish and carry out clear processes of decision-making. All evidence points to an understanding and adherence to the standard related to leadership and governance. Now that the campus community has developed the attitudes and processes for effective planning, evaluation, and improvement for student learning, the college can take some time to work on more formal ways to evaluate how the governance and decision-making structures are working to improve institutional effectiveness. The institution partially meets the standard the above mentioned evaluation.

### **Recommendation**

#### **Recommendation 5**

The team recommends the college develop and implement formal processes for the regular evaluation of each component of its governance and decision-making structures and use the results for improvement as needed. (IVA.5)